

The Power of Their Presence: Minority Group Teachers and Schooling

Alice Quiocho

California State University, San Marcos

Francisco Rios

University of Wyoming

This review focuses on the experiences of minority group teachers as they move into teacher credential programs and then into the teaching profession. Research reports published between 1989 and 1998 were considered if they focused on the experiences of preservice and in-service minority group teachers in public school contexts. After a descriptive synthesis provides a snapshot of the actual experiences of minority group teachers in schooling, a social justice framework is used to guide teacher educators and school-based professionals in their construction of robust recruitment and retention programs. This review demonstrates the power of the presence of minority group teachers but also demonstrates the obstacles to full realization of their potential. Perhaps the opportunity to imagine the possibilities of schooling in the context of making a real difference in students' lives is the catalyst minority group people need to enter and remain in the teaching profession.

At the dawn of the 21st century, the United States is confronted with the legacy of more than 500 years of conquest and subjugation of indigenous people and those who involuntarily immigrated to this country (Ogbu, 1994). Embedded in this conquest was a larger effort at internal colonialism (Barrera, 1979) against people of color. These social evils have left residuals evident in racism in all of its forms (Castles, 1996), since racism and its theories formed the political and intellectual justification for such colonization and hegemonic exploitation (Apple, 1990; Barrera, 1979).

None of this abuse has taken place in a climate of passive acceptance (McCarthy, 1998; San Miguel, 1987; Spring, 1994). Activists within ethnic minority communities advanced what they believed would counter the hegemonic tide. Ethnic studies, affirmative action, and bilingual education became central demands during the civil rights movements of the 1960s and 1970s. Pushed to respond to growing tensions in these communities, the federal government began to cede to the moral stance of fairness and equity to protect the rights of the dispossessed.

We wish to thank Dr. Eileen Oliver at California State University, San Marcos, and several anonymous reviewers for their constructive feedback on earlier versions of this article. We especially thank the editors for their support and direction in the production of the manuscript. We take full responsibility, however, for the final product.

Recently, the government has begun to withdraw from the promise of equal opportunity and social justice (McCarthy, 1998). Public policy decisions around equity and justice have been turned over to the electorate. Thus, the "moral stance" has been swept aside for a "majority rule stance" wherein programs such as affirmative action and bilingual education are held up for "public auction" and subsequently abandoned. All of this takes place at a time when the politics of difference and Euro-American male victimization (i.e., reverse discrimination) dominate, creating fear and resentment among the voting Euro-American male electorate (McCarthy, 1998).

Neither politically nor culturally neutral sites, schools are central locations where public and governmental policies are played out and made tangible (Spring, 2001). Schools have always acknowledged their "enculturation" role; that is, they are agents of cultural reproduction (e.g., the "Americanization" movement targeted at all non-Euro-Americans and incoming immigrants in the first half of the 20th century). But schools are also agents of social reproduction, preparing students for the roles they will assume in the broader society (Apple, 1990; Bartolome, 1994; McCarthy, 1998). Thus, people of color have traditionally been educated (i.e., trained) to occupy menial labor, blue-collar, and/or technical/service occupations (San Miguel, 1987; Spring, 2001).

While this form of racism was more explicit 30 years ago, it continues today. One implicit strategy is the advance of a mainstream curriculum that continues to extol the virtues of a few Euro-American males as this nation's heroes (with boxed inserts for the "contributions" of women and people of color) and typifies much of what is being taught in schools. Beyond the question of what counts as valued "knowledge" (i.e., core curriculums as manifested in the nationwide frenzy over standards and "what every child needs to know"), race/ethnicity-based practices determine what is accepted as appropriate school-based behavior, what is accepted as valued ways of "talk," what is accepted as valued ways of showing what one knows, and what is accepted as valued ways of learning (Scheurich & Young, 1997).

Thus, social inequality exists and flourishes today. It continues, in part, because schools operate within structures of cultural and social reproduction that have embedded in them levels of hegemonic ideology (Apple, 1990; Scheurich & Young, 1997). That this hegemonic ideology exists is problematic. That many of the people who work in schools do not critique the hegemonic ideology that undergirds the structure of schooling is equally problematic. Teachers seem not to have developed a political clarity central to the elements of pedagogical competence (Bartolome, 1994). The failure to employ political clarity about school structures and their underlying hegemonic ideology is due, in part, to workers (principally teachers and administrators) who are captives of their own sociocultural experiences consonant with the hegemonic ideology, whether they realize it or not. This failure exists, in part, because many school-based professionals are unwilling to critique an ideology and structure that may jeopardize their own position of privilege.

We think it is essential that educators ask the following: What roles do schools and the professionals who work in them play in a neoracist, cultural politics that reproduces the existing social order? Must educators reproduce the status quo, or can they lead toward a new, more hopeful vision of the possibilities of democracy (and, if so, how)? Indeed, both ways of responding to this second question exist in schools; however, reproduction seems to be privileged over reconstruction.

For those who favor reconstruction and struggling against hegemony, one strategy would be to employ more ethnic minority teachers. We believe that ethnic minority teachers bring sociocultural experiences that, in the main, make them more aware of the elements of racism embedded within schooling, more willing to name them, and more willing to enact a socially just agenda for society (generally) and schooling (specifically) (Sleeter, 1992).

This review of research is concerned with the “who” of the teaching workforce, proposing that who a person is and what a person brings matters and, indeed, is at the heart of what it means to be a teacher (Palmer, 1998). In this article, we look at the perceptions and experiences of ethnic minority people as they look at the teaching profession. We explore their perceptions and experiences as they are trained in, seek employment for, and find work in teaching. We are guided by the belief that it is not simply their presence in schools that matters. We believe that the power of their presence is in whether or not (and how) they are allowed to transform both the structures and the people in their learning and working environments.

The Present Review

We began by making several strategic decisions that would define the limitations of this review. We wish to be clear that our aim is not a comprehensive review, since the generalities made from such a review would be too superficial to be of value (and this would be an overwhelming task). In all instances, we relied on the authors’ own descriptions of their work to determine whether to review a particular study. Initially, we chose to limit the search on the basis of two criteria. First, as discussed subsequently, we chose to look at studies of “minority group teachers”¹ as a general descriptive category (in fact, the broadest category) rather than focusing on any one specific ethnic group.

Second, we chose to look at only those studies reported in scholarly journals. Thus, for example, we did not review studies reported as part of conference presentations, ERIC documents, chapters in books, and so forth. We chose this strategy because most articles published in scholarly journals have met rigorous standards of review and are more widely distributed. This should not diminish the importance of the other sources of scholarship, especially given that issues of diversity continue to go against the grain of popular yet traditional academic journals and research.

We found 476 records. On the basis of our analysis of these studies, we constructed other decision rules to limit further what we were to analyze and review. Again, we relied on the descriptors used by the author(s), but we also examined the abstracts for each of the 476 studies to determine whether they met the previous criteria as well as several new criteria, discussed next.

First, we chose to look only at research-based reports, since this is a review of “research” and we wanted to focus on what is actually believed to be “evident.” We acknowledge that several position papers (e.g., Darder, 1995; Haberman, 1989; Ladson-Billings, 1992b) were especially helpful in informing our synthesis of the research studies we eventually included. We also did not include reviews of research (although we acknowledge King’s [1993] review of research on African American teachers as a catalyst; see also Zeichner & Hoeft, 1996) or program descriptions (unless the program described was the source of the data gathering and analysis also reported).

Second, in regard to time frame, we chose to look only at studies conducted between 1989 and 1998, since this would give us a contemporary perspective on the perceptions and experiences of ethnic minority people regarding the teaching profession. Third, we chose to focus only on K-12 public schools, since this is where most minority group people target their teaching efforts. Another reason for our focus on K-12 was that we wanted to capture the experiences of minority group people in contexts in which schooling is compulsory. Of note, we did include studies from international contexts, hoping that these investigations would help to illuminate how issues of race/ethnicity and difference are played out in teaching contexts outside the United States. We were left, then, with 39 articles for review (see Table 1).

We recognize the arbitrariness with which these decisions were made. For example, we recognize that the quality and quantity of ethnic minority faculty in colleges of education are of significance in regard to the experience of ethnic minority students in teacher preparation programs (Cochran-Smith, 1995; Dillard, 1994). But where we limit the review, we urge our colleagues in educational research to look at these other issues.

Four principles guide our thinking with respect to minority group teachers. First, there is nothing about being a member of a minority group that guarantees effectiveness in teaching. Rather, because of their success in schools and, presumably, in their home culture, it is believed that the experiences minority group teachers bring will help them to be empathetic toward and skilled in crossing cultural and linguistic boundaries in school contexts (Irvine, 1989). It is their shared social and cultural experiences (Carrasco, Vera, & Cazden, 1981; Nieto, 1998), as well as the cultural mediation skills they have developed for connecting between school and home (Irvine, 1989; Meier, Stewart, & England, 1989), that strengthen their potential for effectiveness in teaching. Conversely, we acknowledge that, in an effort to be successful, some ethnic minority students may have internalized negative images of their own ethnic group (Banks, 1977; Tellez, 1999) and, thus, may be as ineffective as any culturally insensitive Euro-American teacher.

Second, this article does not have as its exclusive focus that which minority group teachers bring to teaching minority group students. It is important to acknowledge what minority group teachers bring to Euro-American students, including positive images of people of color, a realistic understanding of our growing "multicultural" society (Shaw, 1996), and the sheer understanding of learning from people of different backgrounds. In fact, we argue that no students should be educated exclusively by members of their own ethnic minority group.

Third, none of what is reported here should minimize the need for a comprehensive, robust, and strategic teacher education curriculum (Gordon, 1994; Montecinos, 1994; Tomas Rivera Center, 1993). Nieto (1998), in particular, showed that ethnic minority students do not share similar experiences of oppression or cultural orientations with members of other ethnic groups. Thus, this curriculum must address issues of cultural and linguistic diversity, promote social justice, and highlight the possibilities of passion (Darder, 1995).

Fourth, as mentioned earlier, we have opted for a more general perspective on "minority group people." That is, we do not focus principally on the results of studies examining the perspectives and experiences of only one specific ethnic group

(text continues on page 493)

TABLE 1

Research reviewed: Minority group teachers (by author, publication date)

Author(s)	Sample	Methods	Focus/Finding
Alleksaht-Snider, 1996	N=12; 33% minority	Narrative Analysis	Role of one's personal history on her/his perceptions of diversity matters; also, there is value in using narratives.
Bernstein, 1990-91	N=1000; N/S % minority	Data Analysis, Survey	Designed program to help students do better on standardized tests; test scores and feelings of self-efficacy both rose.
Brar, 1991	N/A	Documentation Review	Minority (Black) teachers are given unequal opportunities in employment, placement and promotion in London.
Cabello & Eckmier, 1995a	N=26; N/S % minority	Survey, Interview	Looked at students at end of 5-year program; changes demonstrate that concerns are related to what it means to be a teacher; Emphasized the value of continuing "networks."
Cabello, et al., 1995b	N=37; N/S % minority	Survey, Interview	Described a 5-year program; lists barriers and program components that were valuable; students' biggest concern was with university-local school district communication in year 3.
Calderon, 1990-91	N=50; at least 50% minority	Ethnography	Cooperative learning inservice coupled with peer mentoring proven valuable for all participants.
Contreras & Nicklas, 1993	N=48; N/S % minority	Survey & Data Analysis	Described summer program targeting minority community college students; students need advising and want social and cultural experiences.
Dennis & Giangreco, 1996	N=14; 100% minority	Interviews	Differences existed within ethnic minority groups and it's important to acknowledge one's own socio-cultural location when interviewing minority group families.
Ehrenberger, et al., 1995	N=varied; varied % minority	Data Analysis	Teacher's race didn't matter with respect to minority student academic achievement but minority teachers more positively rate minority students (subjectively).
Feuerverger, 1997	N=20; 100% Canadian minority	Narrative Analysis	Marginalization and the need for a nurturing school environment for minority group teachers in Canada are detailed.
Foster, 1994	N=7; 100% African American	Narrative Analysis	Race matters in school conflicts and reform though most people do not want to acknowledge that it does.

(continued)

TABLE 1
Research reviewed: Minority group teachers (by author, publication date) (continued)

Author(s)	Sample	Methods	Focus/Finding
Galindo, 1996	N=3; 100% Latino	Narrative Analysis	Identity role is a reciprocal social interaction and is related to family value influence of the minority group teachers.
Gonzalez, 1997	N=6 (program level review)	Data Analysis, Interviews, Ethnography	Looked at six different minority teacher recruitment programs to see what features work best; 10 themes are identified; comprehensiveness is key.
Gordon, 1994	N=140; 100% minority	Interview	Identified 17 themes from teachers' narratives regarding negative experiences in schools and obstacles/concerns about the profession.
Green & Weaver, 1992	N=1617; 5% minority	Survey	Concern is demonstrated about low numbers of minority students going into teaching especially since White students have little experience in minority school/community contexts.
Guyton, et al., 1996	N=7; 70% minority	Interviews	Discussed perceptions of self in schooling and teacher education, perceptions of teaching, and special professional pressures along gender, race, and sexual orientation lines.
Haberman, 1993	N=38; 87% minority	Inventory & Rating Form	Participants were surveyed regarding their readiness for urban classrooms; characteristics positively predicted their success.
Hood & Parker, 1994	N=24; 100% minority	Interviews	Identified perceptions and experiences of minority group students in two teacher education programs; concerns with respect to their own preparation are discussed.
Hood & Parker, 1989	N=2 (state level review)	Case Study	Demonstrated how two states involved minority group people differently in the construction, reconstruction, and standardization of state-mandated teacher exams.
Jones, et al., 1997	N=19; 70% minority	Case Study	Described experiences of minority student teachers when compared with Whites in student teaching; discussed how issues of race and difference get played out in field-based experiences.

Kanpol, 1992	N=5; 40% minority	Ethnography	Personal history and empathy are critical in schools and are tied to the wider school/community culture.
Klassen & Carr, 1997	N=117; 50% minority	Questionnaire & Interview	Minority group teachers are committed to social justice and to connecting with minority students.
Ladson-Billings, 1992	N=2; 1 African American	Case Study & Ethnography	Culturally relevant instruction is described; this results in high student achievement, and increased self-efficacy, positive regard for school, and trust from parents/community.
Lipka, 1994	N=24 (case study of 3); Native Alaskan	Data Analysis & Case Study of 3 Yup'ik	Yup'ik had difficulty in finding work, getting employed, and being accepted; focused on institutional factors affecting minority-group teachers.
Lipka, 1991	N=1; Native Alaskan	Case Study	Culturally congruent pedagogy in one Yup'ik village with one Yup'ik teacher is described.
McAlpine & Taylor, 1993	N=45; 100% Native American	Inventory	Differences existed for teacher preferences in teaching and learning across three groups of Native American teachers.
Page & Page, 1991	N=285; 100% African American	Survey, interview and case study of one	Many African American teachers are retiring while few are entering the profession; they experienced low-level classes and were discouraged by student disinterest and parent apathy.
Pavel, 1995	N/A	Data Analysis	Showed number of Native American teachers, staffing patterns, school problems and compensation at BIA and other schools and number of teachers with Native American studies experiences.
Pesek, 1993	N=115; (program level review)	Case Study & Ethnography	Rural schools use "informal" methods for recruiting teachers though minority teachers use "formal" channels.
Pflaum & Abramson, 1990	N=657; N/S % minority	Data Analysis & Survey	Minority teachers are assigned by ethnicity to schools with high numbers of that ethnic group; minority teachers are impacted differentially by employment practices.
Piercynski, et al., 1997	N=19; 100% minority	Interview	The best source for recruitment of minority group teachers in rural areas was the local community.
Quezada, et al., 1996	N=13 (program level review)	Survey	Few programs existed in K-12 to recruit students to teach and none reviewed focused on minority student groups.

(continued)

TABLE 1

Research reviewed: Minority group teachers (by author, publication date) (continued)

Author(s)	Sample	Methods	Focus/Finding
Rhodes & Garibaldi, 1990	N=23; 100% African American	Writing Samples & Interviews	Described program for middle school students; participants more favorably rated their teachers and school subjects afterward.
Stewart, et al., 1989	N/A	Data Analysis	Increases in Black Administrators were positively correlated with increases in Black Teachers hired.
Su, 1997	N=56; 70% minority	Survey	Described minority students' perceptions of the profession and their experience in schooling; minority students bring more of a critical perspective to schooling.
Su, 1994	N=100; 22% minority	Survey	Focused on perceptions of the profession though rarely dis-embed minority from non-minority student responses.
Vance, et al., 1989	N=30; 37% minority	Inventory	Stress experienced by Native American teachers in BIA schools and support received is described; no difference existed between Native American and White teachers.
Watson-Gegeo & Gegeo, 1994	N=5; 100% Kwara'ae	Ethnography	Differential responses existed in which Kwara'ae teachers from the local (Solomon Islands) community have been co-opted or have enacted counter hegemonic styles of teaching.
Yopp, et al., 1992	N=66 (IA); 87% minority; N=95 (HS); 90% minority	Survey, Interview	Looked to two different groups: Instructional Aids (IA) and High School (HS) Students. Identifies scholarship, advising, and cohort as key for former; opportunity to tutor and motivational speakers as key for latter.

N/A = Not Applicable

N/S = Not Stated

or on race/ethnicity across class and gender lines. Rather, we sought to uncover the common struggles that minority group teachers share as they work to overcome similar structures of bias. We also believe that colleges of education and school systems are more likely to educate and employ minority group teachers from a variety of ethnic backgrounds. We want to recognize, however, that there is exemplary scholarship on African American teachers (e.g., Foster, 1997; King, 1993), Latino teachers (e.g., Zapata, 1998), and Native American teachers (e.g., Becket, 1998). We are concerned about the relative lack of scholarship on Asian American teachers as well as specific Asian groups (e.g., see Morey, Nazakawa, & Colvin, 1997; Parker, Allen, Mizoue, Meriwether, & Gardner, 1997). We encourage our colleagues to use these studies as starting points as they look at the challenges and facilitative opportunities of specific ethnic groups, and the interaction of class and gender therein, as they relate to success in the teaching profession.

Descriptive Synthesis

The descriptive synthesis of articles reviewed for this article begins with a section detailing what these studies tell us about “who” minority group people are (personal and professional identity) and then discusses their perceptions of the teaching profession (including reasons for seeking teaching as a career and barriers to entry into the profession). We then move to a chronological organization from ethnic minority group teachers’ preservice experiences to their in-service experiences. Next, we use a brief summary of research on Latino teachers to provide a comparison with findings about minority group teachers in general. In the final section, we examine research addressing minority group people and the teaching profession with a focus on what these studies have reported in regard to equity and social justice.

We employed an equity and social justice framework because this seemed to be a distinct perspective voiced at multiple points in the studies reviewed, because it is consistent with the focus of our own work with minority group students, and because we believe that equity and social justice should be the central goals of schooling. The guiding principles we used, shared here as questions, were taken from *Rethinking Our Classrooms* (Bigelow, Christensen, Karp, Miner, & Peterson, 1994) and were modified for the purposes of this review. We hope that readers will consider these questions, just as we consider them later in this article.

- What do the studies reviewed tell us about the personal and professional lives of minority group people and what drives them toward an approach to teaching that emphasizes equity and social justice?
- What do the studies tell us about minority group people’s beliefs in, experiences with, and enactment of a culturally relevant curriculum that is also academically rigorous?
- What do the studies tell us about multicultural, anti-racist, and pro-justice practices that minority group people may be exposed to and then use?
- What do the studies tell us about the opportunity for minority group people to engage in critical and essential questioning of schooling?
- What do the studies tell us about the possibility that minority group teachers engage collectively in making changes in the school systems in which they find themselves?
- What do the studies tell us about the processes that nurture minority group people into and through the teaching profession in ways that help facilitate a spirit

of hopefulness, joyfulness, and kindness and that encourage them to be visionaries as well as activists?

We acknowledge that studies on these topics related to social justice are rare for any group of school-based professionals. However, since social justice seems to resonate with minority group people, we hope that we will be able to make clear how the studies reviewed can guide future efforts in teacher preparation and retention for all professionals. By bringing this lens to the present work, we hope to uncover the promises and challenges associated with the minority teacher group enacting a social justice and equity framework for schooling.

Table 1 provides an overview (alphabetically, by author) of the studies analyzed for this review. For each, we list the author(s), the sample (number, ethnic group focus, and percentage minority), research methods, and the general theme and/or main finding.

A note is necessary about the research methods used in the studies. As is evident in Table 1, researchers used a variety of methods (both quantitative and qualitative) to ascertain the experiences of ethnic minority group teachers. The favored approaches seemed to be survey research and ethnography (including case studies, narrative analysis, interview, and data analysis). In many instances, survey and ethnographic data were combined. Ethnography is favored, we believe, because of the relatively low number of ethnic minority group teachers in the profession and in teacher education programs. The advantage is that we gain “thick, critical descriptions” (Erickson, 1986) of ethnic minority group teachers’ experiences in specific contexts and with concrete details, in the hopes of making visible and meaningful the complexity of what is usually not seen. Given this tendency toward ethnography, readers are cautioned to remember that the situations and individuals are unique and that conclusions reached are intended only to demonstrate plausibility (Erickson, 1986).

What is not evident in Table 1 is that the perspectives most of the investigators brought to their reports exemplify a “critical science” approach to research (McCutcheon & Jung, 1990). In our reading of these articles, researchers are working to minimize the educational inequalities that minority group teachers experience by casting a critical perspective on the social, cultural, economic, and institutional barriers that these teachers must overcome. It is the critical science perspective that inspires the greatest hopefulness and promise for this continued line of inquiry.

Identity and Perceptions of the Profession

We begin this synthesis by exploring two central issues related to teaching. The first is how teachers come to see themselves as teachers and the role, if any, played by race, class, and gender in these conceptions (Table 2). The second issue is perceptions of the profession, including, among other things, opinions about status, power, and opportunities (or lack thereof) to make a difference (Table 3). Of note, while these questions are of most concern to ethnic minority students considering teaching as a profession, insights about these issues come largely from veteran teachers reflecting upon their own career decisions.

Identity. It seems that minority group teachers’ personal identities are connected to their professional identities (Alleksaht-Snyder, 1996; Galindo, 1996, Kanpol, 1992). These professional identities can consist of how one comes to think about

(text continues on page 497)

TABLE 2

Research reviewed: Identity (by author, date of publication)

Author(s)	Sample	Methods	Focus/Findings
Alleksaht-Snyder, 1996	N=12; 33% minority	Narrative Analysis	Role of one's personal history on her/his perceptions of diversity matters; also, there is value in using narratives.
Galindo, 1996	N=3; 100% Latino	Narrative Analysis	Identity role is a reciprocal social interaction and is related to family value influence of the minority group teachers.
Guyton, et al., 1996	N=7; 70% minority	Interviews	Discussed perceptions of self in schooling and teacher education, perceptions of teaching, and special professional pressures along gender, race, and sexual orientation lines.
Kanpol, 1992	N=5; 40% minority	Ethnography	Personal history and empathy are critical in schools and are tied to the wider school/community culture.
Su, 1997	N=56; 70% minority	Survey	Described minority students' perceptions of the profession and their experience in schooling; minority students bring more of a critical perspective to schooling.
Su, 1994	N=100; 22% minority	Survey	Focused on perceptions of the profession though rarely disembed minority from non-minority student responses.

TABLE 3
Research reviewed: Perceptions of the profession (by author, date of publication)

Author(s)	Sample	Methods	Focus/Findings
Cabello, et al., 1995b	N=37; N/S % minority	Survey, Interview	Described a 5-year program; lists barriers and program components that were valuable; students' biggest concern was with university-local school district communication in year 3.
Gordon, 1994	N=140; 100% minority	Interview	Identified 17 themes from teachers' narratives regarding negative experiences in schools and obstacles/concerns about the profession.
Green & Weaver, 1992	N=1617; 5% minority	Survey	Concern is demonstrated about low numbers of minority students going into teaching especially since White students have little experience in minority school/community contexts.
Guyton, et al., 1996	N=7; 70% minority	Interviews	Discussed perceptions of self in schooling and teacher education, perceptions of teaching, and special professional pressures along gender, race, and sexual orientation lines.
Hood & Parker, 1994	N=24; 100% minority	Interviews	Identified perceptions and experiences of minority group students in two teacher education programs; concerns with respect to their own preparation are discussed.
Klassen & Carr, 1997	N=117; 50% minority	Questionnaire & Interview	Minority group teachers are committed to social justice and to connecting with minority students.
Page & Page, 1991	N=285; 100% African American	Survey, interview and case study of one	Many African American teachers are retiring while few are entering the profession; they experienced low-level classes and were discouraged by student disinterest and parent apathy.
Pflaum & Abramson, 1990	N=657; N/S % minority	Data Analysis & Survey	Minority teachers are assigned by ethnicity to schools with high numbers of that ethnic group; minority teachers are impacted differentially by employment practices.
Su, 1997	N=56; 70% minority	Survey	Described minority students' perceptions of the profession and their experience in schooling; minority students bring more of a critical perspective to schooling.
Su, 1994	N=100; 22% minority	Survey	Focused on perceptions of the profession though rarely disembed minority from non-minority student responses.

education and schooling (generally) and teaching as a profession (specifically). These identities are developed in the context of social and cultural experiences with diversity teachers have in their families, communities, and schools; in turn, their identities are instrumental in teachers' conceptions of diversity (Alexsaht-Snyder, 1996; Kanpol, 1992).

Galindo (1996) found that families have a strong positive influence on teachers' early conceptions of education and teaching. He looked at three Chicana teachers' life stories. The three teachers came from families who had lived in the southwestern United States for at least three generations. Two were the first college graduates in their families; Spanish was the first language for all three. Galindo found that family values were important in defining these teachers' professional lives as well as teacher roles. For example, *para ser bien educado* to be well educated (including well mannered, respectful, and valuing education) was a value communicated to one teacher by different members of her family as a matter of cultural heritage and family pride. Just as it did for the other two Chicana teachers, this value played a critical role in helping this teacher define for herself what it meant to be a teacher.

With respect to the profession, becoming a teacher was an important accomplishment and honor for the minority group teachers in the study by Su (1997). Connected with this accomplishment, these minority group teachers were aware that they were role models for the students they would teach. This is a responsibility that many minority group teachers readily accept (Guyton, Saxton, & Wesche, 1996; Su, 1994). In addition, Su (1997) found that minority group teachers see the need to be change agents in schools. This desire was related to their perceptions of schooling and the teaching profession.

Kanpol (1992) found that teachers' social and cultural experiences were critical to the way they came to regard their role as teachers and influenced their teaching practices. The teachers' social subordination around race, class, gender, and immigration experiences was a significant means of establishing empathy with their ethnic minority students. More important, however, the teachers in this study were able to create and facilitate classroom discussions regarding how "subordination and conflict" can be managed. For these teachers, the goal was development of an image of democracy to counter social hegemony.

Perceptions of the profession. Gordon (1994) detailed reasons why some minority group people see teaching as a "low-status" profession. Gordon's study (1994) on why students of color are not entering teaching reveals that teachers of color in three large urban areas see themselves perceived negatively, as being "less than" other teachers. These teachers believed that prospective teacher candidates of color were unwilling to risk a negative professional image when there were opportunities available to them elsewhere. By extension, perceived racism in the institution of schooling is a factor in why people of color choose other occupations. Studies conducted by Green and Weaver (1992), Page and Page (1991), and Su (1994, 1997) reinforce the fact that negative professional image factors frustrate many minority group teachers.

At the same time, many minority group people's perceptions of low status are made more salient by the greater number of options inherent in other professions, especially those that offer better salaries and that have recently been opened to people of color (Su, 1994). In addition, there can be special pressure from significant

others in the community to be “more than just” a teacher (Guyton et al., 1996). Even African American teachers who have spent 20 years in the profession can feel negatively about teaching as a career. In their study of 285 African American teachers in Georgia, Page and Page (1991) found that only 20.4% of these experienced teachers would choose teaching as a career again. Only 15.8% would recommend teaching as a career to their children. Moreover, low perceptions of the teaching profession may have a negative impact on the length of time minority group people remain as teachers (Pflaum & Abramson, 1990).

Added to low perception of the profession are the barriers to the profession identified by African American teachers (Page & Page, 1991), including the cost of college tuition, lack of role models in college, and high school tracking that did not prepare them for the rigor of college. One study showed that minority group people differ from their Euro-American peers in terms of what would improve the profession; in the main, minority group members wanted increased professional opportunities for those interested in pursuing teaching as well as increased (national) standards for the profession (Pflaum & Abramson, 1990).

Yet, many minority group people are influenced to pursue teaching, first by their family and school-based professionals (Green & Weaver, 1992; Hood & Parker, 1994) and then as a way to make a substantial difference in their communities (Cabello, Eckmier, & Baghieri, 1995; Hood & Parker, 1994). This latter reason for seeking teaching as a profession may rest on minority group people’s perceptions that schools cheat minority students and serve the aspirations of Euro-Americans (Su, 1997); indeed, their own experiences with prejudice in schooling may lead them to this conclusion (Klassen & Carr, 1997). Many minority group teachers believe that they can work to counteract this situation by establishing a culturally relevant and multiculturally inclusive curriculum (Su, 1997) and by helping to transform society (challenge the status quo) to counteract perceived unequal opportunities in schooling (Hood & Parker, 1994; Su, 1997).

Preservice Teachers’ Experiences

This section focuses on the experiences of ethnic minority students in their pursuit of their teaching credential. We detail special programs that help ethnic minority students (K-12, community college, and undergraduate) consider teaching as a profession (Table 4). We then describe these students’ experiences in teacher education programs and in their accompanying field-based student teaching experiences (Table 5). Notwithstanding that people develop a vision of teaching early on in their life, teacher education is one of the most explicit and direct socialization mechanisms used to induct teachers into the profession (Zeichner & Hoelt, 1996). The degree to which that induction is consistent with ethnic minority students’ identity and their vision of schooling is often an important factor in whether the experience is facilitative or debilitating.

Recruitment into teaching. Recognizing the need for diversity in the teaching profession, several universities have undertaken special teacher diversity recruitment programs, most frequently in collaboration with area public schools and/or community colleges. Unfortunately, few of these programs seem to exist at the K-12 level. Quezada, Galbo, Russ, and Vang (1996) found that only 13 of 295 K-12 schools reviewed had teacher recruitment programs, and in none of these pro-

(text continues on page 501)

TABLE 4

Research reviewed: Recruitment into teaching (by author, date of publication)

Author(s)	Sample	Methods	Focus/Findings
Contreras & Nicklas, 1993	N=48; N/S % minority	Survey & Data Analysis	Described summer program targeting minority community college students; students need advising and want social and cultural experiences.
Gonzalez, 1997	N=6 (program level review)	Data Analysis, Interviews, Ethnography	Looked at six different minority teacher recruitment programs to see what features work best; 10 themes are identified; comprehensiveness is key.
Quezada, et al., 1996	N=13 (program level review)	Survey	Few programs existed in K-12 to recruit students to teach and none reviewed focused on minority student groups.
Rhodes & Garibaldi, 1990	N=23; 100% African American	Writing Samples & Interviews	Described program for middle school students; participants more favorably rated their teachers and school subjects afterward.
Yopp, et al., 1992	N=66 (IA); 87% minority; N=95 (HS); 90% minority	Survey, Interview	Looked to two different groups: Instructional Aids (IA) and High School (HS) Students. Identifies scholarship, advising, and cohort as key for former; opportunity to tutor and motivational speakers as key for latter.

TABLE 5

Research reviewed: Experiences in teacher education (by author, date of publication)

Author(s)	Sample	Methods	Focus/Findings
Bernstein, 1990–91	N=1000; N/S % minority	Data Analysis, Survey	Designed program to help students do better on standardized tests; test scores and feelings of self-efficacy both rose.
Cabello, et al., 1995b	N=37; N/S % minority	Survey, Interview	Described a 5-year program; lists barriers and program components that were valuable; students' biggest concern was with university-local school district communication in year 3.
Guyton, et al., 1996	N=7; 70% minority	Interviews	Discussed perceptions of self in schooling and teacher education, perceptions of teaching, and special professional pressures along gender, race, and sexual orientation lines.
Haberman, 1993	N=38; 87% minority	Inventory & Rating Form	Participants were surveyed regarding their readiness for urban classrooms; characteristics positively predicted their success.
Hood & Parker, 1994	N=24; 100% minority	Interviews	Identified perceptions and experiences of minority group students in two teacher education programs; concerns with respect to their own preparation are discussed.
Hood & Parker, 1989	N=2 (state level review)	Case Study	Demonstrated how two states involved minority group people differently in the construction, reconstruction, and standardization of state-mandated teacher exams.
Jones, et al., 1997	N=19; 70% minority	Case Study	Described experiences of minority student teachers when compared with Whites in student teaching; discussed how issues of race and difference get played out in field-based experiences.
Su, 1997	N=56; 70% minority	Survey	Described minority students' perceptions of the profession and their experience in schooling; minority students bring more of a critical perspective to schooling.

grams was recruitment of minority student group members into teaching an explicit goal. One junior high school program for minority group students that focused on teaching as a profession had the impact of increasing participants' positive perceptions of their own teachers and academic content (Rhodes & Garibaldi, 1990).

Yopp, Yopp, and Taylor (1992) described a program for high school minority group students geared around teaching as a career. The project entailed university credit for a high school-based course on teaching that included guest lectures, field trips, workshops, and university-student panel presentations. Yopp et al. (1992) found that the students in their project believed that motivational presentations, especially by minority speakers, were one of the two most critical elements influencing their decision to become teachers. The other motivating factor advancing their consideration of teaching was the opportunity to practice the craft via tutoring.

Yopp et al. (1992) reported a similar project with a special focus on instructional aides conducted under a statewide program aimed at teacher diversity. The study reported that the participants (87% minority) perceived lack of financial support and knowledge of the academic path toward teaching as the two largest roadblocks. The three factors they perceived would most facilitate their movement into the profession were financial aid, faculty mentorships, and peer group support.

Contreras and Nicklas (1993) reported on a program designed to encourage community college students to choose teaching as a profession. The program focused on students in community college, because this is where many African American and Latino students begin their higher education training. A residential summer program was built based on perceived barriers negatively affecting ethnic minority students in teacher certification. The program included three to six units of instruction, financial aid, academic mentorship/tutoring, study skills training, cultural and social activities, advising/counseling, opportunities to connect with university faculty, and opportunities to learn about and use university-based support services and programs. Minority student motivation for teaching increased, especially with knowledge of support programs, and students valued the opportunity to meet others and take university-level courses.

Rather than believing that any one of these factors alone is sufficient for preparing minority group students to enter into teacher credential programs, Gonzalez (1997) argued that comprehensiveness is the key. Looking at six different teacher diversity recruitment programs, Gonzalez identified the following as the most important components of exemplary programs: including a "human" dimension, using peer recruiters, promoting sustained school-based experiences, providing a "bridge" to college, teaching "how to learn" strategies, monitoring participant progress, emphasizing individual responsibility, meeting achievement standards, lowering bureaucratic hurdles, and portraying a different view of teaching.

Experiences in teacher education programs. One area of notable difficulty that most minority group students experience is related to standardized assessments (of general skills and/or academic content knowledge), used in many states, that candidates must pass before entering (or shortly thereafter) a teacher preparation program. Fortunately, at least one general test-taking intervention has proved effective to counteract the disproportionately low achievement rates and levels of self-efficacy of minority group members (Bernstein, 1990–1991).

The ways in which teacher credentialing testing biases are often left intact are made even clearer through evidence of different levels of minority group participation in

test item construction, review, and standard setting. Hood and Parker (1989) provided case studies of two states and how they differentially sought out and used feedback from minority group people about standardized exams. In one state, minority group participants on bias panels met to “sensitively review” test items for that state’s competency exams. By contrast, the other state asked minority group participants to be involved at multiple levels and over an extended period of time with regard to exam construction. These minority group participants were involved in initial test item construction but then looked at test items that negatively affected minority students in an early trial of the test to determine whether individual items should be retained or modified. In addition, these participants were involved in recommending the “passing” score. A critical reason for the difference in how the latter state carried out its review might have been legislation that specifically spoke to the need for unbiased and culturally sensitive teacher competency examinations.

With respect to admissions, Haberman (1993) identified seven factors associated with “star” teachers in urban contexts for which he developed a teacher credential admissions interview protocol. Haberman reported that when respondents reflected characteristics such as persistence, application of ideas to practice, approach to at-risk students, response to bureaucracy, and fallibility as the basis of teacher response and rapport with children of poverty, success in urban classrooms could be predicted. This suggests the importance of increasing the numbers of minority group students in teacher education programs.

Once admitted to teacher preparation programs, another important factor in the preparation of minority group students for the profession is the quality and relevance of their experience as manifested in the contents of teacher education programs. Many minority group students want to see their social and cultural experiences reflected in teacher education curriculums (Guyton et al., 1996; Hood & Parker, 1994). Unfortunately, discourse about difference seems to take place only in courses (required or elective) with multiculturalism as their focus (e.g., see Hood & Parker, 1994). Recall that many minority students bring critical perspectives about schooling to their teacher education programs but have few opportunities to discuss them (Guyton et al., 1996; Hood & Parker, 1994; Su, 1997).

Lack of attention to (critical) diversity issues has resulted in many minority group students’ feeling ill prepared to deal with diversity in school contexts. Hood and Parker’s (1994) informants communicated the degree to which they felt unprepared to deal with issues of cultural diversity in the classroom based on their own lack of experience with a culturally relevant curriculum in their teacher education program. For these students, the only chance to deal with issues of diversity came in multicultural education courses and periodically in foundation classes. Overall, they felt that they faced a Euro-American middle-class orientation in their preparation for the teaching profession, they often believed that superficial attention was focused on diversity issues, and they perceived that Euro-American students’ biases about ethnic minority people went unchallenged. Disturbingly, these minority group students reported that they also detected racist assumptions held by their professors (Hood & Parker, 1994).

Field experiences are part and parcel of teacher preparation programs. Cabello et al. (1995) showed that minority group students were negatively affected when there was insufficient communication and/or inconsistent communication between the university and participating school districts regarding field experience require-

ments. The relationship between the cooperating teacher and the minority group student teacher seemed to be vital to the overall quality of field-based experiences (Cabello et al., 1995; Jones, Maguire, & Watson, 1997). Importantly, many minority group students feel most comfortable in schools with significant student or faculty diversity (Guyton et al., 1996; Su, 1997). This could be due in part to the fact that minority group student teachers in these studies were aware that race matters (i.e., racism exists) in schools and believed that ethnic minority teachers would help them negotiate race-based conflicts. Nonetheless, they also believed that they would be treated respectfully (Guyton et al., 1996; Su, 1997). When schools responded by acknowledging the connections minority group student teachers made to students or peers or by looking to them for the cultural capital that they brought, their experience was positive (Jones et al., 1997). When they felt they were treated without respect, they often responded by simply “copying” their cooperating teacher, developing a conservative approach to teaching, or spending their time connecting with their cooperating teacher at the expense of forging connections with students or the community (Su, 1997).

Cabello and Eckmier (1995) reported that development of a peer-based social network helped minority group student teachers in their study persist, minimize burnout, overcome feelings of isolation, and minimize feelings of being overwhelmed. The network helped them feel understood, allowed them to share resources and strategies, and provided a sounding board to reflect on what they were experiencing in the school environment.

In-Service Teacher Experiences

We now turn our attention to the in-service experience. We begin by detailing the experiences of ethnic minority group members in gaining employment (job search, interview, and selection) and then address job placement and (upward) mobility (Table 6). The work (school) environment where they teach (including connections to others, leadership opportunities, and feeling valued or devalued) is a central issue for in-service teachers (Table 7). We also discuss the degree to which teachers are supported or undermined in making cultural connections in regard to curriculum and instruction (see Table 8). We end this section by looking at professional development and educational reform (see Table 9).

Seeking/gaining employment. Many minority group teachers experience different barriers to employment than their Euro-American peers. For example, most schools involve informal networks (e.g., fellow teacher referrals, word of mouth), and minority group teachers may be disadvantaged by their reliance on formal modes of finding work (e.g., looking in newspapers, using university-based employment services) (Pesek, 1993; Pflaum & Abramson, 1990). This was especially true in the rural areas described by Pircynski, Matranga, and Peltier (1997). The net effect, as described by Pesek (1993), is that although the rural schools studied had an affirmative action plan to recruit teachers from minority groups, less than 0.1% of the teachers in the system came from minority groups.

One of the most comprehensive studies we reviewed provides an extended example of differential experiences in the employment process. This study showed that, in many schools in London, problems in gaining employment began with low passage rates of standardized tests and lack of adequate teacher preparation (Brar,

(text continues on page 508)

TABLE 6

Research reviewed: Job search and placement (by author, date of publication)

Author(s)	Sample	Methods	Focus/Findings
Brar, 1991	Not Applicable	Documentation Review	Minority (Black) teachers are given unequal opportunities in employment, placement and promotion in London.
Lipka, 1994	N=24 (case study of 3); Native Alaskan	Data Analysis & Case Study of 3 Yup'ik	Yup'ik had difficulty in finding work, getting employed, and being accepted; focused on institutional factors affecting minority-group teachers.
Pavel, 1995	N/A	Data Analysis	Showed number of Native American teachers, staffing patterns, school problems and compensation at BIA and other schools and number of teachers with Native American studies experiences.
Pesek, 1993	N=115; (program level review)	Case Study & Ethnography	Rural schools use "informal" methods for recruiting teachers though minority teachers use "formal" channels.
Pflaum & Abramson, 1990	N=657; N/S % minority	Data Analysis & Survey	Minority teachers are assigned by ethnicity to schools with high numbers of that ethnic group; minority teachers are impacted differentially by employment practices.
Piercynski, et al., 1997	N=19; 100% minority	Interview	The best source for recruitment of minority group teachers in rural areas was the local community.
Stewart, et al., 1989	N/A	Data Analysis	Increases in Black Administrators were positively correlated with increases in Black Teachers hired.
Su, 1997	N=56; 70% minority	Survey	Described minority students' perceptions of the profession and their experience in schooling; minority students bring more of a critical perspective to schooling.

TABLE 7

Research reviewed: School environment for inservice teachers (by author, date of publication)

Author(s)	Sample	Methods	Focus/Findings
Dennis & Giangreco, 1996	N=14; 100% minority	Interviews	Differences existed within ethnic minority groups and it's important to acknowledge one's own socio-cultural location when interviewing minority group families.
Ehrenberger, et al., 1995	N=varied; varied % minority	Data Analysis	Teacher's race didn't matter with respect to minority student academic achievement but minority teachers more positively rate minority students (subjectively).
Feuerverger, 1997	N=20; 100% Canadian minority	Narrative Analysis	Marginalization and the need for a nurturing school environment for minority group teachers in Canada are detailed.
Foster, 1994	N=7; 100% African American	Narrative Analysis	Race matters in school conflicts and reform though most people do not want to acknowledge that it does.
Guyton, et al., 1996	N=7; 70% minority	Interviews	Discussed perceptions of self in schooling and teacher education, perceptions of teaching, and special professional pressures along gender, race, and sexual orientation lines.
Klassen & Carr, 1997	N=117; 50% minority	Questionnaire & Interview	Minority group teachers are committed to social justice and to connecting with minority students.
Page & Page, 1991	N=285; 100% African American	Survey, interview and case study	Many African American teachers are retiring while few are entering the profession; they experienced low-level classes and were discouraged by student disinterest and parent apathy.
Pflaum & Abramson, 1990	N=657; N/S % minority	Data Analysis & Survey	Minority teachers are assigned by ethnicity to schools with high numbers of that ethnic group; minority teachers are impacted differentially by employment practices.
Su, 1997	N=56; 70% minority	Survey	Described minority students' perceptions of the profession and their experience in schooling; minority students bring more of a critical perspective to schooling.
Vance, et al., 1989	N=30; 37% minority	Inventory	Stress experienced by Native American teachers in BIA schools and support received is described; no difference existed between Native American and White teachers.



Review of Educational Research

JAIME GRINBERG and ELIZABETH R. SAAVEDRA
The Constitution of Bilingual/ESL Education as
a Disciplinary Practice: Genealogical Explorations

KAREN M. LA PARO and ROBERT C. PIANTA
Predicting Children's Competence in the Early School Years:
A Meta-Analytic Review

ALICE QUIOCHO and FRANCISCO RIOS
The Power of Their Presence:
Minority Group Teachers and Schooling

LARRY E. SUTER
Is Student Achievement Immutable?
Evidence From International Studies on Schooling
and Student Achievement

MEGAN TSCHANNEN-MORAN and WAYNE K. HOY
A Multidisciplinary Analysis of the Nature,
Meaning, and Measurement of Trust

TABLE 8
Research reviewed: Culturally responsive teaching (by author, date of publication)

Author(s)	Sample	Methods	Focus/Findings
Foster, 1994	N=7; 100% African American	Narrative Analysis	Race matters in school conflicts and reform though most people do not want to acknowledge that it does.
Ladson-Billings, 1992	N=2; 1 African American	Case Study & Ethnography	Culturally relevant instruction is described; this results in high student achievement, and increased self-efficacy, positive regard for school, and trust from parents/ community.
Lipka, 1994	N=24 (case study of 3); Native Alaskan	Data Analysis & Case Study of 3 Yup'ik	Yup'ik had difficulty in finding work, getting employed, and being accepted; focused on institutional factors affecting minority-group teachers.
Lipka, 1991	N=1; Native Alaskan	Case Study	Culturally congruent pedagogy in one Yup'ik village with one Yup'ik teacher is described.
McAlpine & Taylor, 1993	N=45; 100% Native American	Inventory	Differences existed for teacher preferences in teaching and learning across three groups of Native American teachers.
Watson-Gegeo & Gegeo, 1994	N=5; 100% Kwara'ae	Ethnography	Differential responses existed in which Kwara'ae teachers from the local (Solomon Islands) community have been co-opted or have enacted counter hegemonic styles of teaching.

TABLE 9

Research reviewed: Professional development and reform (by author, date of publication)

Author(s)	Sample	Methods	Focus/Findings
Allestaht-Snyder, 1996	N=12; 33% minority	Narrative Analysis	Role of one's personal history on her/his perceptions of diversity matters; also, there is value in using narratives.
Brar, 1991	Not Applicable	Documentation Review	Minority (Black) teachers are given unequal opportunities in employment, placement and promotion in London.
Calderon, 1990-91	N=50; at least 50% minority	Ethnography	Cooperative learning inservice coupled with peer mentoring proven valuable for all participants.
Foster, 1994	N=7; 100% African American	Narrative Analysis	Race matters in school conflicts and reform though most people do not want to acknowledge that it does.
Piercynski, et al., 1997	N=19; 100% minority	Interview	The best source for recruitment of minority group teachers in rural areas was the local community.
Su, 1997	N=56; 70% minority	Survey	Described minority students' perceptions of the profession and their experience in schooling; minority students bring more of a critical perspective to schooling.
Vance, et al., 1989	N=30; 37% minority	Inventory	Stress experienced by Native American teachers in BIA schools and support received is described; no difference existed between Native American and White teachers.

1991). Recruitment teams visiting colleges to interview prospective teachers were usually composed of only White recruiters, and this created a divide in which minority candidates were often referred to as "them." In the interview process, there were perceptions among minority group persons that they were not given sufficient time or were not treated courteously (Brar, 1991; see also Pflaum & Abramson, 1990).

Given these initial hurdles, it did not surprise us that Brar (1991) found that many Black teachers in London are less likely to gain full-time employment and then less likely to be promoted than White teachers, even though many are better qualified. In terms of gaining employment, 13.3% of Black teachers were unemployed for longer than one term, as opposed to 0.7% of White teachers (Brar, 1991). While 8.6% of Black teachers were on temporary contracts, 5.1% of White teachers were temporarily employed. Whereas experiences and qualifications from other countries were seen as a barrier for most Black teachers, they did not pose an obstacle for most White teachers. Although the Black teachers studied were more qualified in terms of educational level, 21% had to first serve as substitute teachers, and 8.8% were still substitutes after their first year of teaching (as compared with 1.3% of White teachers). Data on the 2,400 teachers studied showed that Black teachers were almost always on the bottom rung in terms of status and position within schools.

Brar (1991) found that Black teachers' experiences during employment were erratic, while there appeared to be a steady employment pattern for White teachers. After years of employment (13 for White teachers and 10 or more for Black teachers), White teachers were able to advance to a higher level than Black teachers. This was due, in part, to the fact that Black teachers were not encouraged to seek promotions, while White teachers were so encouraged. Whereas 27% of Black teachers were teaching subjects for which they had not been trained, only 6.2% of White teachers were teaching out of their fields. A position in multicultural support services usually served as a springboard to other positions for White teachers, while Black teachers were unable to change their multicultural support services designation.

Perhaps the most provocative findings in these studies involve the perspectives and identities of those making hiring decisions regarding minority group teachers. Brar's (1991) study is especially insightful in this regard. The decision makers were not aware of their biases against hiring Black teachers, even though Black teachers saw and experienced inequities in hiring and advancement. A disturbing set of findings included head teachers' beliefs (a) that they had no shortage of Black teachers, (b) that their hiring procedures were not faulty, (c) that there were no Black applicants for positions, and (d) that though they were aware of problems, these issues did not really matter. Many head teachers reported that they were not aware of the low status of Black teachers, and others noted that Black and Asian teachers posed difficulties in that they did not speak "proper" English (Brar, 1991). Similarly, in the United States, some research has revealed a positive correlation between number of African American teachers hired and number of African American school administrators present in the system (Stewart, Meier, & England, 1989).

Gaining and keeping employment also seemed to be a problem for qualified teachers who were Yup'ik. Lipka (1994) found that native Yup'ik teachers in Alaska had difficulty being hired and retained even after receiving their teaching certificate through a special program in which teachers studied in their villages and attended mandatory professional development training sessions and area training meetings.

With respect to school placement, Pflaum and Abramson (1990) found that there was a positive correlation between teachers' minority group identity and the schools where they were placed such that African American and Latino teachers found themselves teaching primarily African American and Latino students, respectively. Percentage of Black and Hispanic teachers was negatively associated with percentage of Euro-American and Asian students, while percentage of Euro-American teachers was negatively associated with percentage of Hispanic and Black students. This by itself was not a problem. Recall that, given the desire of many ethnic minority teachers to make a difference in their community, it is evident that many minority group teachers want to work in inner-city schools with poor, minority students (Su, 1997). Clearly, many minority teachers found themselves in schools with students from backgrounds similar to their own. The problem is that few of these novice teachers had access to mentoring programs.

Pavel (1995) found a similar pattern when he compared Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) schools, tribal schools, public schools with a high percentage of American Indian students, and public schools that served a lower percentage of American Indian or Alaskan Indian students. In Pavel's study, more Native American teachers and principals were employed in the BIA and tribal schools than in the public high schools. In the public schools, Native American teachers earned less, received less mentoring, and filled more positions as substitutes.

School climate. Once minority group teachers obtain employment, they often find themselves placed in schools with fellow teachers who are more likely to lack teacher certification or who have minimal experience in teaching (Pflaum & Abramson, 1990). This is problematic in terms of who will mentor these new teachers during these first critical years. An added tension is that many minority group teachers are likely to feel alienated from their colleagues (both teachers and administrators), who often avoid discussing issues of race and schooling. Gaps in communication between colleagues often result in feelings of marginalization as well as alienation. Conversely, ethnic minority teachers are likely to have positive relations with colleagues who are members of the same ethnic group (i.e., conflicts arise along racial lines) (Foster, 1994). Indeed, different minority group teachers can experience different degrees of support from peers, administrators, and significant others (Vance, Miller, Humphreys, & Reynolds, 1989).

One theme that has emerged is the perception of the "marginalized" teacher. In Feuerverger's (1997) study of immigrant teachers in Canada, the teachers' personal narratives were used to talk about the complexities of being marginalized. Feuerverger (1997) found that the immigrant teachers in this study were well educated; half of them had master's degrees from universities in their home countries, one had a doctorate, and the other nine had bachelor's degrees. In spite of the training they received, these teachers were treated as second-class citizens and began to see themselves as such. They found themselves catapulted into a culture that refused to recognize either their strengths or the strengths of their students. Feelings of marginalization also stemmed from communications with colleagues around cultural identity (i.e., "who they were" as professionals). Marginalization of the immigrant teachers was further amplified when they met with the immigrant parents of their students. Schooling had created a communication gap between parents and children, and now these teachers struggled to find ways to bridge that gap.

These Canadian immigrant teachers also felt marginalized because although they were committed to creating a multiculturally inclusive school environment, they found that they were not supported by the school system (Feuerverger, 1997). They felt alienated and vulnerable. Cut off from any decision making and/or innovative curriculum development, these teachers found themselves part of a system that cared nothing about equity and social justice for ethnic minority teachers or for students.

Page and Page (1991) described one African American teacher whose experiences paralleled those of other minority group teachers. When hired as a science teacher at a high school, this teacher was told that all new teachers were assigned to low-level classes. After years of teaching and repeatedly requesting higher level science classes, the teacher's requests were still denied. Yet, when a new Euro-American teacher came to the same school and asked *not* to teach the assigned advanced biology class because she felt unprepared, this teacher was told that she must teach it. Not only was the African American teacher angry with what happened to her, but she also felt powerless.

Many minority group teachers also feel that schools do not recognize the strengths that they bring (Feuerverger, 1997), and they feel alienated from school goals and values (Foster, 1994). The clash of beliefs around schools as sites for diversity, anti-racism, equity, social justice, and transformation becomes problematic for many minority group teachers who believe that most teachers and administrators want conformity and maintenance of the status quo (Feuerverger, 1997; Foster, 1994; Klassen & Carr, 1997). Minority group teachers have reported not feeling supported in efforts to create an inclusive, multicultural environment (Feuerverger, 1997). Alienation from colleagues and from the school site generally becomes a source of stress that often operates across ethnic groups (Vance et al., 1989) in addition to pressures such as those stemming from, for example, culturally mediating discipline problems and communication gaps (Guyton et al., 1996).

Starting out, then, many ethnic minority teachers might be at odds with the perspectives of most other professionals at the school site around issues of anti-racism as a goal of schooling. In a survey of 70 secondary teachers regarding anti-racist education, Klassen and Carr (1997) found that such education was supported differently by different teachers. Whereas minority teachers had direct experience with racism in their lives and supported anti-racist education, Euro-American teachers were (in the main) unaware of prejudices and thus did not support anti-racist education. Most minority group teachers in the study believed that they play an important role in connecting with minority students, but they also believed that the principal of the school is critical to the institutionalization of anti-racist education.

Schooling is, among other things, a social activity. Minority group teachers often believe that they can play a crucial role in connecting with minority group students (Klassen & Carr, 1997). However, just as revealing, the race of the teacher can be a salient factor in subjective judgments of minority group students (who are more highly rated by minority group teachers) even if there is no difference in academic achievement among students (Ehrenberg, Goldhaber, & Brewer, 1995).

While many minority group teachers see the need to connect (and the importance of connecting) to the broader community (Su, 1997), communication gaps with parents can also be a source of frustration (Feuerverger, 1997). When preparing minority group teachers who seek collaboration with families and community

groups, it is important to help them recognize the differences between families within a community and to be aware of their own limitations in understanding those from cultural groups different from their own (Dennis & Giangreco, 1996).

Diversity in curriculum and instruction. As has been shown, one source of tension in the school climate can be the degree to which schools support or undermine efforts to enact a culturally responsive pedagogy. With respect to instruction, clearly there exist distinct ethnic-specific cultural preferences for learning that teachers bring to the classroom (Ladson-Billings, 1992a; Lipka, 1991). For example, in the McAlpine and Taylor study (1993), Native American teachers from three different nations/tribes showed culture-specific instructional preferences that were influenced by local community and school factors. Looking at the instructional preferences of Cree, Inuit, and Mohawk teachers relative to those of mainstream teachers, McAlpine and Taylor (1993) found that Aboriginal teachers showed a negative preference for organization, whereas mainstream teachers valued organization. Aboriginal teachers were more likely to encourage children to work independently, believing that valuable learning occurs when children work independently and have the opportunity to decide how to accomplish goals. Whereas Aboriginal teachers showed a negative preference for inanimate objects and positive preferences for qualitative and human dimensions of learning, mainstream teachers preferred inanimate objects and quantitative ways of learning. Aboriginal teachers showed a neutral preference for lecturing and a positive preference for reading and direct experience, while mainstream teachers preferred lecturing and learning in the abstract.

In Lipka's study (1991), culturally relevant teaching appeared to be different from that of mainstream teachers, whose classrooms were highly organized according to specific norms. Alternatively, silence, watching others, and demonstrations were used for learning in Yup'ik classrooms. Turn taking was governed by different rules. What would be perceived as an interruption in mainstream classrooms was considered normal interaction in that culture. We are reminded that opinions drawn about classroom routines and teaching are meaningless in the absence of a cultural context.

While in search of a culturally relevant literacy curriculum for African American students, Ladson-Billings (1992b) observed and interviewed an African American teacher whose students performed at a high academic achievement level, felt positive about themselves as well as the school, and were leaders in the classroom. This fourth-grade teacher was highly respected by parents and built trust with students, parents, and the broader community. Ladson-Billings found the following culturally relevant elements that contributed to success in this classroom:

- The teacher legitimated African American culture and heritage, using it as a frame of reference for all learning.
- The teacher did not shy away from issues of race and culture.
- Students were appreciated and celebrated as members of a specific culture.
- There was constant physical contact such as hugging when praising as well as admonishing students.
- Students' home language was valued in discussions.
- The classroom was lively with student talk.
- There was a familial atmosphere in which the teacher and students took responsibility for what happened in the classroom and the value of learning in community was recognized.

Quiocho and Rios

- Failure was not an option.
- The teacher provided support for students to be themselves and to choose academic excellence rather than allowing academic achievement to seem alienating and foreign.
- The teacher shared power with students.
- Physical arrangements in the classroom resembled students' home living experience.
- The teacher made decisions about what to teach students that frequently exceeded state and district mandates.
- The teacher was not intimidated by standardized tests.
- The teacher and students critically examined the curriculum.
- Students compared what they learned in the classroom with their own experiences.

This teacher did not look at literacy as something to teach and as something that would provide students with employment opportunities; she saw literacy as a means of personal and cultural liberation.

Unfortunately, problems can exist even when contexts are constructed for indigenous people to develop culturally compatible approaches to teaching. Lipka (1994) found that Yup'ik teachers, trained and certified in the district where they would teach to capture local culture and make connections, became suspect in the view of school-based personnel because they did not reflect a mainstream American classroom canon in their teaching styles or their interactions with students.

Thus, it appears that teachers do not advance culturally relevant approaches to instruction in an uncontested manner; in fact, culturally responsive approaches to teaching go against social and political forces. Watson-Gegeo and Gegeo (1994) analyzed the role of the Kwara'ae culture in the Solomon Islands. Of the five Kwara'ae teachers observed, three taught in the colonial style characterized by the teaching of facts, oral recitation, and rote memory, qualities not valued by the Kwara'ae culture. The result was the creation of an educational elite of Kwara'ae cloned in the image and likeness of the Euro-American conqueror who had come to "civilize" the natives (Watson-Gegeo & Gegeo, 1994).

Foster (1994) found that one teacher had designed a course in history that had been working well for African American students. This teacher had to give that class up because of a district mandate to move from homogeneous (ethnic) groupings to heterogeneous groupings in her high school. Students who had previously struggled blossomed in this teacher's homogeneously grouped class. Their grades had improved, and they had mastered the academic content of history. Another teacher was criticized for using teaching strategies that were out of date, although African American students who enrolled in her classes were academically successful and had responded positively to her culturally relevant style of teaching.

Foster (1994) suggested that a brief golden age once existed between schools and minority communities until the struggle for formal educational opportunity became an issue. Today, conflicts often arise because schools and districts are structured according to institutional imperatives that posit the necessity of a bureaucracy with established norms dictating "the way we do things around here." Concomitantly, Black teachers in Foster's (1994) study felt that the most serious conflicts arose along racial lines. Because issues of race were not considered appropriate topics to discuss among faculty members, they were rarely raised. Thus, genuine multi-

cultural, anti-racist, and pro-justice practices were not a critical part of conversation at this school site.

Professional development and educational reform. Many minority group teachers are interested in continued professional development, especially into the administrative ranks (Su, 1997); recall their interest in making changes in schools and add their perception that administrators are in greater decision-making positions. Minority group teachers are also interested in becoming more efficacious in their efforts to be leaders and to confront racism. The use of narratives seems to be a promising practice in this regard (Allexsaht-Snider, 1996).

Strategies for connecting to more experienced teacher colleagues (i.e., mentoring in the context of learning about new teaching strategies) show promise as a positive professional development activity (Calderon, 1990–1991). It would seem valuable to place minority teachers in schools and districts where professional mentoring is available and opportunities for sharing personal and professional lives are considered important. Calderon (1990–1991) demonstrated how this can be done via the pairing of expert and novice teachers in in-service training around cooperative learning activities to build a natural coaching support network. In these situations, many minority group teachers may find themselves in positions where they are encouraged (and learn how) to question the system and develop strategies that positively affect the academic success of minority students.

Learning to cope with stress and developing “problem-solving” support networks might be a concomitant result of developing a professional community. Vance et al. (1989) considered the issue of job stress among teachers in BIA schools. The sample included 30 interns employed to teach on an Indian reservation. Of the 11 who were teachers of color, a majority were Native American. All were affected by stress to some degree. The few who were professionally involved in the activities and life of the school were more satisfied with their jobs despite their stress.

According to Piercynski et al. (1997), given how difficult it is to find minority group teachers committed to teaching in rural contexts, it is very important to devise ways to retain them once they accept employment. Of note, Piercynski et al. found that the respect and professionalism of staff, the overall school climate, and the opportunity to pursue further education were positively related to minority group teacher retention in rural school districts (and the same would be true, we argue, in all school districts).

Educational reform is usually seen in a positive light. However, with respect to minority group teachers, educational reform can have a negative impact on efforts to diversify the faculty. For example, Brar (1991) found that reforms aimed at allowing greater local autonomy over employment-based decisions by local hiring boards failed to ensure diversity in those employed. Likewise, instructional efforts by minority group teachers that have positive effects on student achievement can sometimes be subverted if they are seen in the negative light of a climate of educational reform (Foster, 1994).

The Latino Experience in Teacher Education

As mentioned earlier, there is much that can be learned by focusing on specific ethnic groups. We provide an abbreviated summary of what can be learned by focusing on one specific ethnic group: Latinos. We chose Latinos² for this abbreviated

summary since they represent the largest group of students with whom we work and, given the tremendous demographic growth of this ethnic group, an emerging source of future teachers. Mack and Jackson (1993), for example, found that of the Latino high school students they surveyed, nearly one in three would seriously consider teaching as a profession. Unfortunately, this must be tempered by knowledge that Latino dropout rates at the high school level are the highest of any ethnic minority group (50%) other than Native Americans (Gonzalez, 1992).

There is a history, though not well documented, of a Latino presence in the teaching workforce. Gonzales-Berry (1997) interviewed New Mexican Latinas who found their way into teaching during a time when it was rare for women of their culture to seek leadership positions in the community. Gonzales-Berry (1997) argued that the experiences of the nine women interviewed, who came from small towns and rural families, mirror the experiences of present-day Hispanic teachers and preservice teachers. All of these Latinas had wanted to be teachers from the time they were very young, and most started teaching at an early age (17 or 18 years). Interestingly, all were encouraged to seek teaching as a career by their fathers. They attended university classes during the summers to complete their degrees and the credentialing process. Once employed, they found that they had a variety of roles to fill in their communities, from writing letters and catalogue orders to working as cooks and janitors at their schools. All experienced obstructive political structures and encountered social discrimination; on the other hand, they received energy and support from their communities.

More recently, a sample of Latino students identified both barriers to and opportunities in the teaching profession. They reported that teaching is a profession that is respected in the Latino community and brings honor to one's family (Su, 1996) but that, unfortunately, barriers are often so significant that respect and honor may simply not be sufficient.

With respect to barriers, Su (1996) found that Latino students' negative school experiences centered around their English proficiency, strength of accent, and skin color. For example, the lighter skinned Latinos reported less discrimination in schools than did those with darker skin. Language characteristics and skin color often affected the expectations teachers had for these students as well as the degree to which their voice was affirmed. More specifically related to teaching, Latino youth have identified low salary, low prestige, and absence of positive information about teaching as a profession; lack of career awareness; and lack of encouragement as central barriers to their pursuing teaching (Mack & Jackson, 1993; Su, 1996).

With respect to encouragement, Latino youth in the Mack and Jackson (1993) study identified teachers as the most important significant others who could influence career decision making in regard to teaching. The lack of encouraging role models becomes especially problematic for those students who are male; in combination with the few males in the teaching profession, *machismo*³ leads many male Latino students to conclude that teaching is "women's work" (Su, 1996).

Given these challenges, special programs designed to recruit and retain future Latino teachers seem to be warranted, especially those that have systemic support/mentoring mechanisms (Becket, 1998; Burant, 1999; Mullen, 1997; Zapata, 1998). Zapata (1998) looked at Project I Teach, a collaborative program between a university and two local school districts focused on the early identification of Latino high school students interested in teaching. Zapata found that these Latino high school students needed academic support (e.g., study skills, test taking skills), so

they were prepared to take the SAT. In addition, Zapata (1998) asserted that these Latino students required psychological support, financial support, and a mentoring program they could use upon arriving at the university. In return, the Latino students in this summer program extended their classroom learning by working as teaching assistants.

In an examination of two nontraditional programs aimed at increasing the number of Navajo and Latino teachers in hard-to-staff schools, Becket (1998) focused on the individuals already working in these schools: paraeducators. Consistent with the need for support, both programs involved a cohort model in which students stayed together throughout to provide each other with support and motivation. Both programs provided mentor teachers at field experience sites and emphasized participant quality; that is, program requirements were not easier or fewer than those of traditional programs. The programs also included a "value-added model" (i.e., traditional teacher education courses along with additional courses such as sessions to assist students experiencing academic problems in a variety of courses). Both programs were flexible in terms of length, and candidates' experiences in schools were a key factor in consideration. Nonetheless, family obligations and working requirements often slowed the process of credential completion for these two groups of students. It is evident that such nontraditional programs must have a clear vision and mission to which all involved are committed.

One significant factor with a powerful (negative) impact on Latino teacher candidates is statewide testing examinations (Zapata, 1987/1988). In Texas, Zapata found that 90% of White students taking all three proficiency tests (math, reading, and writing) passed, in comparison with only 6% of Hispanics. English language ability seems to be a major variable assessed on these tests. Zapata (1998) suggested the use of tests that authentically assess what teachers actually do rather than tests that restrict Latinos interested in teaching as a career.

Once they are enrolled in teacher education, how Latino students' voices are encouraged or silenced depends on both professors' and classmates' behavior in classroom discussions (most frequently about diversity) (Burant, 1999). Burant's case study of a Mexican American student showed the positive influence of professors in the student's voicing of her experiences. The student began to write in her journal about herself, her family, and her schooling experiences, but she also began to raise questions about standardized testing, equality and social justice, and the effect of charter schools in her community. Correspondingly, she became an active participant in her teacher education class, at the school at which she was placed, and in community-based activities. Yet, the student's voice was silenced when her classmates lashed out at another student in the class who had challenged their commitment to diversity. After that encounter, the student restricted her communications to her journal and to private discussions. Burant (1999) concluded that reforms in teacher education can be realized only by including the voices of those outside the mainstream and urged that these students be considered "as they travel their own paths, accommodating new information into the larger frame of their own lives" (p. 9).

In her study on cultural self-identity among Hispanic preservice teachers, Mullen (1997) advocated creating reforms that support Latino teachers by first listening to their experiences and perspectives. The 11 Latina candidates with whom she worked revealed pride in their cultural group, wherein accomplishments come with struggle, oppression, and pressure to assimilate. The candidates expressed a

need for a system that provided assistance to them as well as allowed them time to give back to peers and their communities. In addition, these Latinas expressed the need for interaction with people from a variety of cultural groups on the university campus. However, they also identified discourse opportunities as being important: opportunities to talk about issues related to teaching with Hispanics (especially in the context of community-based organizations that serve students) aimed at a deeper understanding of Hispanic culture and devoid of disempowering language that is deficiency oriented.

Asking whether or not minority group teachers will use their cultural capital to employ a culturally relevant curriculum, Tellez (1999) revealed that the four Mexican American teachers he interviewed did not automatically use their cultural knowledge in the curriculum. These students had come to believe what they had been taught: that all students are the same and can be taught in the same way. During their student teaching experiences, these Mexican American student teachers taught a traditional curriculum, partly as a result of a lack of encouragement to use their cultural knowledge to develop culturally appropriate material. They had been encouraged by their master teachers to teach in a manner they deemed acceptable.

Tellez (1999) explored the influence of the assimilation process on his Mexican American informants. One student refused to learn Spanish and noted that too many Mexican Americans went along with “what everyone was doing [in traditional Mexican culture] even if it stopped them from doing well in school” (p. 565). She wanted Mexican American students to see what was wrong with their culture. After a course in Chicano history, this student teacher began to see the importance of this knowledge for her Mexican American students and worked to engage them with their history through lessons and materials she developed on her own. Another student teacher had explicit knowledge of the Mexican American culture but used this knowledge only to make connections outside of the classroom (the only exception was the use of music by Selena).

In sum, the need for strong support systems, the need to understand the role of race in schooling, the need to understand how teachers’ concerns are silenced or absent, and the need to find ways to have students incorporate their cultural knowledge in curriculum and instruction are some of the issues that minority group teachers share with Latino teachers. In the literature and in our experience, we add the Latino-specific difficulties associated with immigration status, the challenges associated with language proficiency (and magnified by English proficiency teacher exams) and Spanish language accent prejudices, the lack of culturally empowering knowledge about the Latino culture as part and parcel of school curriculums, and school district reluctance to hire Latino students perceived as too radical because of their advocacy orientation in regard to their local communities.

Like Tellez (1999), we also see many instances in which assimilation has affected Mexican American students in ways that limit their ability to see possibilities for culturally appropriate curriculum and instruction. We find ourselves challenged to unlock the cultural suitcase that Latino students have packed since birth and that guides how their culture (family, community, language) has shaped their lives. Yet, for many, this suitcase of cultural knowledge is discarded at the schoolhouse door, or students learn that its contents work against their becoming “successful.” Indeed, Latino students are at different positions on the assimilation continuum. Only after Latino student teachers recognize their cultural strengths will teacher educators’ efforts to help them

develop a culturally responsive curriculum, including the context of the “developmental setting” (Tellez, 1999, p. 568) of student teaching, be fruitful.

Ethnic Minority Teachers and Equity: What About Social Justice?

This descriptive synthesis and Latino-specific review provides a glimpse into the experiences of many minority group people as they consider teaching, as they are trained for the profession, and as they move through teaching as a career. This synthesis helps us to consider a variety of barriers as well as points of promise in our work with minority group teachers. What it does not do is provide a clear direction for our efforts that are theoretically grounded and morally just. As suggested earlier, in this section we engage in theoretical reflection around ethnic minority group teachers and the call for social justice.

It is clear to us that many ethnic minority teachers come to the profession with social-cultural experiences that lead them to see society (and schools, by extension) as being unfair for large groups of students. It is equally clear to us that, while not automatic or guaranteed, most of these teachers quickly embrace a social justice framework for schooling that would ameliorate some of the effects of these unjust practices. Unfortunately, what many ethnic minority teachers experience in pre-service and in-service contexts is pressure to conform to traditional approaches to teaching and learning. This becomes a source of conflict/tension and professional disappointment. Consider what we have learned from these studies in light of the principles of the social justice framework posed earlier: personal and professional lives; culturally relevant curriculum; multicultural, anti-racist, and pro-justice practices; questioning schooling; changing schooling; and processes that nurture.

Personal and Professional Lives

What do the studies reviewed tell us about the personal and professional lives of minority group people and what drives them toward an approach to teaching that emphasizes equity and social justice? How teachers perceive themselves as people and as members of cultural groups, including families, often defines how they see themselves as professionals (Allextaht-Snyder, 1996; Feuerverger, 1997; Foster, 1994; Galindo, 1996; Kanpol, 1992; McAlpine & Taylor, 1993). Thus, the experiences one has and the identity one develops, especially around issues of race and diversity in the context of family, community, and schools, has a great influence on how one comes to regard issues of race and diversity, as well as social justice, as a teacher (Allextaht-Snyder, 1996). Equally important, these identities are not static but exist in continual development and revision (Allextaht-Snyder, 1996; Feuerverger, 1997; Galindo, 1996) as ethnic minority group teachers are influenced by the people with whom they come in contact in schooling contexts (administrators, parents, peers, and, especially, students). Further, these teachers' self-image seems to be related to all of their relationships as well as to the responsibilities that develop between them and their students, parents, colleagues, and administrators.

It is no coincidence that the 24 minority undergraduate students Hood and Parker (1994) interviewed spoke with a critical, social justice consciousness. After all, one criterion the participants met was that of having “spent most of their youth in urban settings and/or communities where the majority of residents were people of color” (p. 165). Presumably, these experiences shaped the students' understanding of what

it means to be a member of a minority group and the challenges associated with equity and social justice in school contexts (Kanpol, 1992). Given these experiences and perceptions, teaching became a site where social justice and the opportunity to make a difference in their own ethnic minority communities, as well as the academic lives of minority students, could be realized (Cabello et al., 1995; Hood & Parker, 1994; Su, 1994).

But disconcerting among these findings is the “marginalization” experienced by the teachers (Brar, 1991; Foster, 1994; Feuerverger, 1997). These teachers’ prior educational and professional experiences were minimized. They were not supported in curricular innovation and were not involved in decision making. They felt disconnected with the surrounding professional community as well as the local community the school served. Collectively, these teachers had to reconcile their image as agents of change with their experiences of marginalization.

We are reminded of the value associated with learning about the personal and professional lives of minority group people. We need to be especially aware of the conditions under which a social justice perspective develops. Some of these conditions stem from social and cultural experiences. However, the value of these experiences must be nurtured in teacher education programs as well as in schools if a social justice orientation is to flower. We believe that making changes in teacher education and in public schools that allow for teaching within a framework of social justice will have value for all those (both minority and mainstream) who come to teaching.

Culturally Relevant Curriculum

What do the studies reviewed tell us about minority group people’s beliefs in, experiences with, and enactment of a culturally relevant yet academically rigorous curriculum? Central to the quest for social justice is a curriculum that is culturally relevant and academically rigorous. In our search, we found studies that sought to analyze curriculums that were culturally relevant. Cabello et al. (1995) found that Latinos, in particular, were keenly interested in striving for a curriculum that was responsive to and representative of the Latino experience. Ladson-Billings’s (1992b) description of culturally responsive teaching provides a framework and vision of what this approach to teaching looks like in practice. McAlpine and Taylor (1993) and Lipka (1994) showed important differences in the instructional preferences of teachers from different tribal groups.

Yet, we were also struck by the challenges to a culturally relevant curriculum. Engaging in this approach to pedagogy is difficult if, in their teacher preparation programs, ethnic minority teachers do not experience a culturally relevant pedagogy or worse yet feel as though their instructors are racist (Hood & Parker, 1994). Teachers can be co-opted in their teaching style and exemplify hegemonic approaches to teaching (Watson-Gegeo & Gegeo, 1994). Indeed, holding on to culturally congruent approaches to teaching can render teachers suspect by the broader school community since such approaches do not conform to the mainstream (Foster, 1994; Lipka, 1994).

These studies give us ideas about strides being made in the development of a culturally relevant curriculum that is academically rigorous. If there are *system-wide* efforts being made to genuinely shift from teaching in and through the Western

canon to include other perspectives and materials, they did not surface in our search. Given the relationship and interaction of teachers' social and cultural lives to their professional lives, it would seem that teacher educators and school-based personnel would do well to affirm what minority group teachers bring to facilitate the development of a culturally relevant curriculum that is academically rigorous. Beyond benefiting students, we believe this would mitigate feelings of marginalization and show that minority group members are valued as people and teachers.

Multicultural, Anti-Racist, and Pro-Justice Practices

What do the studies reviewed tell us about multicultural, anti-racist, and pro-justice practices that minority group people may be exposed to and then employ? Some of the most significant efforts around pro-justice practices are recruitment and retention programs specifically designed to prepare and support minority students through and into (in some cases) their first years of teaching. Programs directed at undergraduate minority group students show the need for, and value of, establishing a sense of community among participants (Cabello & Eckmier, 1995; Contreras & Nicklas, 1993; Yopp et al., 1992). Other positively related practices described in these studies include the need for careful advising in course selection and quantity (Contreras & Nicklas, 1993), the role of scholarships as a motivational tool (Yopp et al., 1992), and the importance of using such programs as an opportunity to expose minority group students to the varieties and locations of university-based student support services that will assist them in their efforts to pursue their teaching degree. Gonzalez (1997) added to these elements the importance of using peer recruiters, engaging in sustained school-based experiences (e.g., tutoring), teaching "how to learn" strategies, monitoring participant progress, lowering bureaucratic hurdles, and portraying a different view of teaching.

A second element of a multicultural, anti-racist, pro-justice approach would be to ensure diversity in employment and assignment hiring patterns. The challenges here include working to remove the barriers to the teaching profession exemplified by standardized exams. With respect to job search, hiring, and placement, the challenges are multifaceted and begin with hiring committees and directors being aware of the possible differential effects of traditional approaches to hiring on ethnic minority teachers. The key may be to provide models and mentors to ethnic minority teachers at multiple points in the employment process so that chances of success in securing employment are increased.

Social justice assumes that people are interested in and support multicultural, anti-racist, and pro-justice practices in schools as well as districts. Since most administrative positions appear to be held by nonminorities (Foster, 1994), and anti-racist education is often perceived by nonminorities as unnecessary (Klassen & Carr, 1997), there is much work to be done in creating school systems that honor, respect, and are committed to multicultural, anti-racist, and pro-justice practices.

If we are to value a multicultural, anti-racist, and pro-justice approach to schooling, we need to find ways to increase the presence of minority group teachers in all schools (urban, suburban, rural, BIA, etc.). This would begin to ensure that all students have multicultural schooling experiences via their teachers who represent the world in terms of ethnicity, language, and culture. But we also need to create space for discourse around the impact of race on schooling so that racist assumptions can be problematized. The role of administrators seems to be critical in this regard. We

are encouraged by programs aimed at creating conditions of success for those traditionally left out of the teaching profession. Especially promising are programs that nurture minority group people early on, through teacher credentialing, and into their critical first years of teaching.

Questioning Schooling

What do the studies reviewed tell us about the opportunity for minority group people to ask critical and essential questions about schooling? While several of the studies reviewed (e.g., Contreras & Nicklas, 1993; Hood & Parker, 1994) gave minority undergraduate students an opportunity to question the teacher education system in which they were schooled, only one of the studies reported on ways in which the feedback was used (beyond reporting of the data) to actually question the system. This is unfortunate, especially since minority group students (Hood & Parker, 1994) have reported that they are concerned that some of their Euro-American peers will end up in multicultural, urban contexts for which they are unprepared. Given their status as minority students, it does not surprise us (but it does dismay us) that opportunities for students to voice such concerns about teachers and peers are not systematic.

But paying attention to these voices can serve as a catalyst for change (significant or nominal). Hood and Parker (1994) made a follow-up visit to the two university sites where they had conducted interviews with ethnic minority students. One of the universities had taken several active steps to improve its attention to diversity issues in its teacher education program. At this site, efforts included professional development of the faculty, course review, and collaboration with an urban school system for field-based experiences. Conversely, the major effort at the other university was the appointment of a senior faculty member of color to the task of increasing and retaining the number of ethnic minority students in its teacher education program.

Obviously, one's professional location has an impact on what one is in a position to question and change. Brar (1991) looked at the issue of institutional racism and its effect on minority teachers in London. Brar found unequal opportunities in regard to recruitment, selection, and promotion of Black teachers in spite of "reforms" that provided for local financial management and control of resources to meet local needs.

Even in cases in which Black teachers have tried to make a difference by becoming agents of change (Foster, 1994), they can be silenced by those in power and by within-school class structures already at work against minority students. Foster (1994) and Gordon (1994) found that African American teachers, on the whole, felt alienated from the school and their colleagues. Although some of the African American teachers were involved in school mentoring efforts, and most felt they had better working relations with other African American teachers on staff, the group as a whole felt that the discord that divided them from their school revolved around race.

In short, hiring practices tangibly demonstrate how institutional racism can exist in schools. Further, it seems impossible for minority group teachers to question the system and become proactive in making changes if they are uncertain about employment and promotion, they are relegated to low status within a system, they do not have opportunities to be mentored into the profession, or they are trapped in positions where advancement is out of reach. In essence, the voices of minority teachers have been silenced. We believe that the work of achieving social justice must involve minority group students and that minority group teachers' voices must be heard.

Changing Schooling

What do the studies reviewed tell us about the opportunities for minority group teachers to make decisions about and collectively change the school systems in which they find themselves? One issue that continues to dominate the concerns of preservice minority group people considering teaching is the gatekeeper role of standardized exams for entry into the profession. These tests seem to be less accurate in judging potential teacher competency (if judging it at all) while producing high failure rates for minority group people (Haney, Madaus, & Kreitzer, 1987; Hood & Parker, 1989). A logical line of inquiry around this concern is the degree to which minority group people are involved in the construction and review of standardized teaching examinations.

The studies we reviewed did not focus on the role of minority teachers as decision makers beyond the everyday decisions teachers must make in their classrooms. Foster (1994) found that although some Black teachers were involved in change efforts, including school-wide mentoring, their influence stopped there. The one Black teacher who found herself in a decision-making position at the school level left that school for another. She went where she felt she would be more effective, that is, where her leadership would be taken more seriously and valued by colleagues as well as administrators.

Stewart et al. (1989) found that there is a positive correlation between number of African Americans in leadership positions (i.e., educational administrators) and number of African American teachers employed. This is important in showing the link between the social, cultural, political, and structural characteristics of schools and the access minority group teachers have to work at school sites. We are encouraged by Su's work (1997) showing that minority group students aspire to administrative roles because they are aware of the impact broader school-wide efforts can yield.

Minority group teachers perceive schooling-based problems around issues of diversity. They are eager (in fact, committed) to make a difference. However, efforts to achieve more culturally and socially responsible schools become exceedingly more difficult if these individuals feel that they have not been prepared to be effective teachers in multicultural school contexts, if they are marginalized in finding and securing employment, or if their efforts to "name" inequities and then work for change are interrupted.

Processes That Nurture

What do the studies reviewed tell us about how minority group people can be nurtured into and through the teaching profession in ways that help facilitate a spirit of hopefulness, joyfulness, and kindness and that encourage them to be visionaries as well as activists? The need to create nurturing communities of practice for minority group teachers is clearly evident. Recall Gordon's (1994) and Page and Page's (1991) studies regarding in-service teachers' perspectives on the teaching profession and teaching as a career. That most of these individuals would not, if given the chance, choose teaching as a career is both instructive and disquieting.

For preservice teachers, developing a community of learners seems to be a central tenet of helpful support as they move toward their teaching credential. Peer group support was one of the most valued activities associated with the programs described by Cabello and Eckmier (1995) and Yopp et al. (1992). The strength of this group support increased over time as bonds between peers flourished. These

teachers came to see the commonality of their struggles as they worked alongside people who shared a common goal and developed a sense of belonging to the group. The program described by Calderon (1990–1991) that involved mentoring in the context of professional development seems particularly robust.

Perhaps the value of community resides in the power of having people share their personal and professional lives. Allexaht-Snyder (1996) found that telling and listening to personal stories in an ethnically mixed group transformed all participants. It was invaluable as a way to reflect and effect change in the professional lives of teachers. But perhaps as significant, insights gained from having one's story thought important led teachers to openly confront institutional racism in their schools and to take on leadership roles.

It is important that people enjoy their work. It is especially critical that teachers, specifically minority group teachers, enjoy their work with students, value being part of a specific system, and consequently look at their professional lives as joyful, creative, and valuable in that they are contributing to the success of their students, communities, and districts. Opportunities for professional development must occur in qualitatively different ways than are experienced in teacher credential programs. They must be directed toward professional nurturing, be systematic, and change over time as professional needs change.

Summary

We know that the number of minority group people who are prepared for and interested in teaching as a career is limited. As we reflect on this review, it is evident that many barriers will ensure that these numbers remain low. Barriers to teacher certification include negative perceptions of the profession, inequities in testing and admission into teacher education, and the incongruence of minority group pre-service teachers' experiences with traditional teacher education curriculums. Once minority group members have their credentials, they face discrimination in employment practices, culturally discontinuous school climates and taboos about raising issues of racism, lack of promotion opportunities, and failure of others to recognize their leadership skills.

Likewise, as we reflect back, we see the potential power of their presence. Many minority group teachers, in comparison with their European-American counterparts, are more likely to bring a critical, social justice orientation and consciousness that stems from their real, lived experiences with inequality. In a related way, they are often more willing to work actively to dismantle the personal and institutional biases that they find in schools as well as to move toward culturally responsive school-based reform. Minority group teachers tend to have a greater sense of how to develop (and therefore enact) culturally relevant curriculums and to understand the human, social, and communal nature of teaching and learning. Perhaps the opportunities to learn, to laugh, and to imagine the possibilities of schooling in the context of making a real difference in students' lives can serve as a catalyst for minority group people to enter the profession as well as help to retain those who already work there.

We encourage our peers in the teacher education profession to have, as a professional goal, increasing the number of minority group students interested in becoming teachers and making this part of the fabric of the institutions where they work. An active research agenda that further illuminates the complexities associated with gaining access into the profession for minority group people should be a part of efforts to develop programs and activities that will serve this end.

We encourage scholars to look at the experiences and perceptions of specific minority group people (Latinos, Native Americans, etc.), especially across class and gender lines. With respect to our abbreviated review, for example, we see that Latinos experience many of the same difficulties that all ethnic minority students face when pursuing teaching as a career: testing biases, negative perceptions of the teaching profession, teacher education curriculums that are unresponsive to their cultural capital or that fail to facilitate development of a culturally responsive pedagogy, and pressure in field-based experiences to conform to traditional approaches to teaching. But we also see important differences: the differing ways in which people respond to pressures to assimilate, the honor and status of teachers in the Latino culture, the opportunity to use teaching to give back to the community, the sensitive nature of “voice,” the role of varying degrees of bilingualism and commitment to bilingual education, the challenges associated with different immigration statuses, and the especially critical need to create community. We believe that ethnic-specific research will make significant contributions.

Beyond examinations of specific academic disciplines (e.g., math, science, art), we also look forward to hearing from our peers in regard to the following questions:

- What is the impact of anti-affirmative action policies on minority student group recruitment into and retention in teaching? What constructive alternatives can be developed?
- What can we do to assess and value equity and justice principles that potential teachers might bring to the profession?
- What are the roles, challenges, and opportunities associated with alternative certification programs targeting ethnic minority teacher candidates?
- What can we do in universities and schools of education, as well as in public school contexts, to nurture a social justice orientation that encourages and supports minority group teachers to use their cultural knowledge to forge a culturally responsive pedagogy?
- What professional development activities will help minority group teachers to flourish throughout their career, and how must these activities change to meet the needs of this group of teachers at different times?
- Under what conditions can alliances be created with peers, students, parents, administrators, and others? How can these alliances be systematically established and supported?

Many schools are making efforts to implement a curriculum that includes multicultural education, but we know that this is not enough. What is needed is a multicultural education curriculum coupled with the power of the presence of minority group teachers and the cultural mediation abilities they bring to their work. There is a need for nurturing networks that include and support the professional development of minority group teachers and that combat the rise of political antagonism. These networks would ensure that minority group teachers do not become assimilated into a system that demands social and political obedience and that often leads to the apathy and antagonism in regard to social justice characteristic of many veteran teachers. There is a critical need for institutional cooperation at all levels of the educational system to recruit and support teachers from minority groups. The entire system must be consciously guided by pedagogical principles that are humanizing and supported by collaborative relations of power. We call for a system-wide commitment to social

justice wherein every person accepts responsibility for the success of creating a diverse teaching workforce.

The lives of students will be enriched beyond measure by experiencing the power of the presence of teachers from minority groups. Students can benefit from broadened perspectives of culture and the sense of social justice that is nurtured by spending time in classrooms with teachers from minority groups. We call upon our colleagues in teacher education to revitalize and strengthen their efforts to recruit preservice teachers from minority groups and provide the kind of support we found lacking. We call upon school districts to make a real commitment to equity via the recruitment, retention, and promotion of teachers from minority groups and to act aggressively on that commitment. We are convinced that schools, at all levels of the educational system, will be enriched through the power of the presence of minority group teachers.

Notes

¹A note about language: Although we do not feel entirely comfortable with the term *minority group teachers*, we chose to use it throughout because it was the ERIC search-based term that was most general (and, we assumed, most inclusive). We know that minority as a demographic characteristic is problematic given the emergence of “the new majority.” Conversely, we recognized that this group, even in situations of numerical supremacy, still operates within social and institutional structures of powerlessness. In describing specific studies, we try to use the terms (e.g., Black, African American) used by the researcher(s) in an effort to maintain the integrity of that work. We urge readers to consider Nieto’s (1996) discussion of language and labels.

²We use the term *Latino* but ask readers to consider the different groups that this general label includes: Cubans, Mexicans, Puerto Ricans, and so forth. Often labels used, even within the same ethnic group, convey different identities, especially vis-a-vis assimilation. For example, American, Americano, Mexican American, Chicano, and Mejicano are used by people of the same ethnic background (Mexican) but reflect the influence of assimilation (from more assimilated to less).

³Machismo is loosely defined as masculinity or virility but with many cultural overtones, both positive and negative.

⁴For example, Wilberschied and Dassier (1995) looked at the number of minority group persons who seek foreign language teaching as a profession. Their description of the variety of barriers potentially faced by minority group people who might become foreign language teachers demonstrated the multiple causes of and social/structural impediments to entry and persistence. Content area barriers include minority group students’ attitudes about teaching the academic discipline, challenges to study-abroad requirements, language prejudices, and testing hurdles. Clearly, academic discipline matters.

References

- Allexsaht-Snider, M. (1996). Windows into diverse worlds: The telling and sharing of teachers’ life histories. *Education and Urban Society*, 29, 103–119.
- Apple, M. (1990). *Ideology and curriculum*. New York: Routledge.
- Banks, J. A. (1977). The implications of multicultural education for teacher education. In F. H. Klassen & D. M. Gollnick (Eds.), *Pluralism and the American teacher: Issues and cases* (pp. 1–29). Washington, DC: Ethnic Heritage Center for Teacher Education.
- Barrera, M. (1979). *Race and class in the Southwest: A theory of racial inequality*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press.

- Bartolome, L. I. (1994). Beyond the methods fetish: Toward a humanizing pedagogy. *Harvard Educational Review*, 64, 173–194.
- Becket, D. R. (1998). Increasing the number of Latino and Navajo teachers in hard-to-staff schools. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 49, 196–205.
- Bernstein, L. (1990–1991). Improving test-taking skills of secondary students. *Teacher Education and Practice*, 6, 71–72.
- Bigelow, B., Christensen, L., Karp, S., Miner, B., & Peterson, B. (1994). Creating classrooms for equity and social justice. In B. Bigelow, L. Christensen, S. Karp, B. Miner, & B. Peterson (Eds.), *Rethinking our classrooms* (pp. 4–5). Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools.
- Brar, H. S. (1991). Unequal opportunities: The recruitment, selection, and promotion prospects of Black teachers. *Evaluation and Research in Education*, 5, 35–47.
- Burant, J. J. (1999). Finding, using, and losing voice: A preservice teacher's experiences in an urban educative practicum. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 50, 209–219.
- Cabello, B., & Eckmier, J. (1995). Looking back: Teachers' reflections on an innovative teacher preparation program. *Action in Teacher Education*, 17(3), 33–42.
- Cabello, B., Eckmier, J., & Baghieri, H. (1995). The comprehensive teacher institute: Successes and pitfalls of an innovative teacher preparation program. *Teacher Educator*, 31, 43–55.
- Calderon, M. (1990–1991). Cooperative learning builds communities of teachers. *Teacher Education and Practice*, 6, 75–77.
- Carrasco, R. L., Vera, A., & Cazden, C. (1981). Aspects of bilingual students' communicative competence in the classroom. In R. P. Duran (Ed.), *Latino language and communicative behavior*. Norwood, NJ: Ablex.
- Castles, S. (1996). The racisms of globalisation. In E. Vasta & S. Castles (Eds.), *The teeth are smiling* (pp. 17–45). St. Leonards, New South Wales, Australia: Allen & Unwin.
- Cochran-Smith, M. (1995). Uncertain allies: Understanding the boundaries of race and teaching. *Harvard Educational Review*, 65, 541–570.
- Contreras, G., & Nicklas, W. L. (1993). Attracting minority community/junior college students to teaching. *Action in Teacher Education*, 15(1), 1–7.
- Darder, A. (1995). Buscando America: The contributions of critical Latino educators to the academic development and empowerment of Latino students in the U.S. In C. E. Sleeter & P. L. McLaren (Eds.), *Multicultural education, critical pedagogy, and the politics of difference* (pp. 319–348). Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Dennis, R. E., & Giangreco, M. F. (1996). Creating conversation: Reflections on cultural sensitivity in family interviewing. *Exceptional Children*, 63, 103–116.
- Dillard, C. (1994). Beyond supply and demand. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 45, 9–17.
- Ehrenberg, R. G., Goldhaber, D. D., & Brewer, D. J. (1995). Do Teachers' race, gender, and ethnicity matter? Evidence from the National Educational Longitudinal Study of 1988. *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*, 48, 547–561.
- Erickson, F. (1986). Qualitative methods in research on teaching. In M. Wittrock (Ed.), *Handbook of research on teaching* (pp. 119–161). New York: Macmillan.
- Feuerverger, G. (1997). "On the edges of the map": A study of heritage language teachers in Toronto. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 13, 39–53.
- Foster, M. (1994). The role of community and culture in school reform efforts: Examining the views of African-American teachers. *Educational Foundations*, 8(2), 5–26.
- Foster, M. (1997). *Black teachers on teaching*. New York: New Press.
- Galindo, R. (1996). Reframing the past in the present: Chicana teacher role identity as a bridging identity. *Education and Urban Society*, 29, 85–102.
- Gonzalez, G. M. (1992, January). *The 21st century: A futuristic look at recruitment and retention in teacher education programs for Hispanic Americans*. Paper presented at the Recruitment and Retention of Minorities in Education meeting, Lexington, KY.

- Gonzalez, J. M. (1997). Recruiting and training minority teachers: Student views of the preservice program. *Equity and Excellence in Education, 30*, 56–64.
- Gonzalez-Berry, E. (1997). Las maestras: Pioneers in education. *La Herencia del Norte, 16*, 52–53.
- Gordon, J. A. (1994). Why students of color are not entering teaching: Reflections from minority teachers. *Journal of Teacher Education, 45*, 346–353.
- Green, J. E., & Weaver, R. A. (1992). Who aspires to teach? A descriptive study of preservice teachers. *Contemporary Education, 63*, 234–238.
- Guyton, E., Saxton, R., & Wesche, M. (1996). Experiences of diverse students in teacher education. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 12*, 643–652.
- Haberman, M. (1989). More minority teachers. *Phi Delta Kappan, 70*, 771–776.
- Haberman, M. (1993). Predicting the success of urban teachers (the Milwaukee trials). *Action in Teacher Education, 15*(3), 1–5.
- Haney, W., Madaus, G., & Kreitzer, A. (1987). Charms Talismanic: Testing teachers for the improvement of American education. In E. Rothkopf (Ed.), *Review of research in education, 14*, 169–238. American Educational Research Association.
- Hood, S., & Parker, L. J. (1989). Minority bias review panels and teacher testing for initial certification: A comparison of two states efforts. *Journal of Negro Education, 58*, 511–519.
- Hood, S., & Parker, L. J. (1994). Minority students informing the faculty: Implications for racial diversity and the future of teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education, 45*, 164–171.
- Irvine, J. J. (1989). Beyond role models: An examination of cultural influences on the pedagogical practices of Black teachers. *Peabody Journal of Education, 66*, 51–63.
- Jones, C., Maguire, M., & Watson, B. (1997). The school experience of some minority ethnic students in London schools during initial teacher training. *Journal of Education for Teaching, 23*, 131–144.
- Kanpol, B. (1992). The politics of similarity within difference: A pedagogy for the other. *Urban Review, 24*, 105–131.
- King, S. H. (1993). The limited presence of African American teachers. *Review of Educational Research, 63*, 115–149.
- Klassen, T. R., & Carr, P. D. (1997). Different perceptions of race in education: Racial minority and White teachers. *Canadian Journal of Education, 22*, 67–81.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (1992a). Reading between the lines and beyond the pages: A culturally relevant approach to literacy teaching. *Theory Into Practice, 31*, 312–320.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (1992b). Culturally relevant teaching: The key to making multicultural education work. In C. Grant (Ed.), *Research and multicultural education* (pp. 106–121). London: Falmer Press.
- Lipka, J. (1991). Toward a culturally based pedagogy: A case study of one Yup'ik Eskimo teacher. *Anthropology and Education Quarterly, 22*, 203–223.
- Lipka, J. (1994). Schools failing minority teachers: Problems and suggestions. *Educational Foundations, 8*(2), 57–80.
- Mack, F. R. P., & Jackson, T. E. (1993). *Teacher education as a career choice of Hispanic high school seniors*. Unpublished report. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 358 087)
- McAlpine, L., & Taylor, D. M. (1993). Instructional preferences of Cree, Inuit, and Mohawk teachers. *Journal of American Indian Education, 33*, 1–20.
- McCarthy, C. (1998). *The uses of culture: Education and the limits of ethnic affiliation*. New York: Routledge.
- McCutcheon, G., & Jung, B. (1990). Alternative perspectives on action research. *Theory Into Practice, 29*, 144–151.
- Meier, K. J., Stewart, J., & England, R. E. (1989). *Race, class and education: The politics of second-generation discrimination*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press.

- Montecinos, C. (1994). Teachers of color and multiculturalism. *Equity and Excellence in Education*, 27(3), 34–42.
- Morey, A. I., Nazakawa, K., & Colvin, C. (1997). Japanese and American student teacher voices. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 72, 203–214.
- Mullen, C. A. (1997, March). *Hearing the voices of Hispanic preservice teachers*. Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Chicago.
- Nieto, S. (1996). *Affirming diversity: The sociopolitical context for multicultural education*. White Plains, NY: Longman.
- Nieto, S. (1998). From claiming hegemony to sharing space: Creating community in multicultural education courses. In R. Chavez-Chavez & J. O'Donnell (Eds.), *Speaking the unpleasant: The politics of non-engagement in the multicultural education terrain* (pp. 16–31). Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Ogbu, J. (1994). Racial stratification and education in the U.S.: Why inequality persists. *Teachers College Record*, 96(2), 264–298.
- Page, J. A., & Page, F. M., Jr. (1991). Gaining access into academe: Perceptions and experiences of African American teachers. *Urban League Review*, 15, 27–39.
- Palmer, P. (1998). *The courage to teach: Exploring the inner landscape of a teacher's life*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Parker, W., Allen, G., Mizoue, Y., Meriwether, C., & Gardner, W. (1997). Japanese and American preservice teachers' attitudes toward global issues and relations. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 72, 187–202.
- Pavel, D. M. (1995). Comparing BIA and tribal schools with public schools: A look at the year 1990–91. *Journal of American Indian Education*, 35, 10–15.
- Pesek, J. G. (1993). Recruiting and retaining teachers in Pennsylvania's rural school districts. *Rural Educator*, 14(3), 25–30.
- Pflaum, S. W., & Abramson, T. (1990). Teacher assignment, hiring, and preparation: Minority teachers in New York City. *Urban Review*, 22, 17–31.
- Piercynski, M., Matranga, M., & Peltier, G. (1997). Legislative appropriation for minority teacher recruitment: Did it really matter? *Clearing House*, 70, 205–206.
- Quezada, R. L., Galbo, J. J., Russ, P. M., & Vang, A. T. (1996). Teacher recruitment programs for K-12 students: Implications for teacher education. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 23(4), 85–94.
- Rhodes, E. M., & Garibaldi, A. M. (1990). Teacher cadets answer the call. *Momentum*, 21(4), 36–38.
- San Miguel, G. (1987). *Let them all take heed: Mexican Americans and the campaign for educational equality in Texas, 1901–81*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Scheurich, J. J., & Young, M. D. (1997). Coloring epistemologies: Are our research epistemologies racially biased? *Educational Researcher*, 26(4), 4–16.
- Shaw, C. C. (1996). The big picture: An inquiry into the motivations of African American teacher education students to be or not to be teachers. *American Educational Research Journal*, 33, 327–354.
- Sleeter, C. E. (1992). *Keepers of the American dream*. Washington, DC: Falmer Press.
- Spring, J. (1994). *Deculturalization and the struggle for equality*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Stewart, J., Jr., Meier, K. J., & England, R. E. (1989). In quest of role models: Change in Black teacher representation in urban school districts, 1968–1986. *Journal of Negro Education*, 58, 140–152.
- Su, Z. (1994). Who will teach our children: Implications for the teaching profession. *Professional Educator*, 16(2), 1–10.
- Su, Z. (1996). Why teach? Profiles and entry perspectives of minority students as becoming teachers. *Journal of Research and Development*, 29, 117–133.

Quiocho and Rios

- Su, Z. (1997). Teaching as a profession and as a career: Minority candidates' perspectives. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 13*, 325–340.
- Tellez, K. (1999). Mexican-American preservice teachers and the intransigency of the elementary school curriculum. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 15*, 555–570.
- Tomas Rivera Center. (1993). *Resolving a crisis in education: Latino teachers for tomorrow's classrooms*. Claremont, CA: Author.
- Vance, B., Miller, S., Humphreys, S., & Reynolds, F. (1989). Sources and manifestations of occupational stress as reported by full-time teachers working in a BIA school. *Journal of American Indian Education, 28*, 21–31.
- Watson-Gegeo, K. A., & Gegeo, D. W. (1994). Keeping culture out of the classroom in rural Solomon Islands schools: A critical analysis. *Educational Foundations, 8*(2), 27–55.
- Wilberschied, L., & Dassier, J. P. (1995). Increasing the number of minority FL educators: Local action to meet a national imperative. *Modern Language Journal, 79*, 1–14.
- Yopp, R. H., Yopp, H. K., & Taylor, H. P. (1992). Profiles and viewpoints of minority candidates in a teacher diversity project. *Teacher Education Quarterly, 19*(3), 29–48.
- Zapata, J. (1987/1988). Impact of testing on Hispanic teacher candidates. *Teacher Education and Practice, 4*, 19–24.
- Zapata, J. (1998). Early identification and recruitment of Hispanic teacher candidates. *Journal of Teacher Education, 39*, 19–23.
- Zeichner, K. M., & Hoeft, K. (1996). Teacher socialization for cultural diversity. In J. Sikula, T. Buttery, & E. Guyton (Eds.), *Handbook of research on teacher education* (2nd ed., pp. 525–547). New York: Macmillan.

Authors

ALICE QUIOCHO is an Associate Professor with specializations in reading/language arts and bilingual education, College of Education, CSU-San Marcos, San Marcos, CA 92096-0001; aquiocho@mailhost1.csusm.edu.

FRANCISCO RIOS is Associate Professor and Department Chair, Educational Studies, College of Education, University of Wyoming, 202 McWhinnie Hall, P.O. Box 3374, Laramie, WY 82071-3374; frios@uwoyo.edu.